



SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES

February 28, 2023

A Special Meeting of the Council of the City of Vancouver was held on Tuesday, February 28, 2023, at 9:31 am, in the Council Chamber, Third Floor, City Hall, for the purpose of hearing from speakers on the 2023 Draft Operating Budget. This Special Council meeting was convened by electronic means as authorized in Part 14 of the *Procedure By-law*.

PRESENT:

- Mayor Ken Sim
- Councillor Rebecca Bligh
- Councillor Christine Boyle
- Councillor Adriane Carr
- Councillor Lisa Dominato
- Councillor Pete Fry
- Councillor Sarah Kirby-Yung
- Councillor Mike Klassen
- Councillor Peter Meiszner
- Councillor Brian Montague
- Councillor Lenny Zhou

CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE: Paul Mochrie, City Manager
Armin Amrolia, Deputy City Manager

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Rosemary Hagiwara, Acting City Clerk
Olivia Kam, Meeting Coordinator

WELCOME

The Mayor acknowledged we are on the unceded homelands of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh People. We thank them for having cared for this land and look forward to working with them in partnership as we continue to build this great city together.

The Mayor also recognized the immense contributions of the City of Vancouver's staff who work hard every day to help make our city an incredible place to live, work, and play.

1. 2023 Draft Operating Budget February 14, 2023

The City Manager provided opening remarks and Council received a presentation on the 2023 Draft Operating Budget from the General Manager of Finance, Risk and Supply Chain Management, along with the Director of Citywide Financial Planning and Analysis, the Chief Communications Officer of Civic Engagement and Communications and the Vancouver Police Department Chief Constable.

* * * * *

Following the presentation, members of the City's Leadership Team and staff responded to questions:

Patrice Impey, General Manager of Finance, Risk and Supply Chain Management
Colin Knight, Director of Citywide Financial Planning and Analysis
Adam Palmer, VPD Chief Constable, Vancouver Police Department
Karen Fry, Fire Chief and General Manager, Vancouver Fire and Rescue Services
Lon LaClaire, General Manager, Engineering Services
Sandra Singh, General Manager, Arts, Culture and Community Services
Doug Smith, Deputy General Manager of Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability
Branislav Henselmann, Managing Director of Cultural Services

* * * * *

During questions to staff, it was,

*MOVED by Councillor Boyle
SECONDED by Councillor Carr*

THAT under section 5.4(d) of the Procedure By-law, Council ask a second round of questions to staff.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

* * * * *

During the second round of questions to staff, it was

*MOVED by Councillor Boyle
SECONDED by Councillor Carr*

THAT Council suspend the rules of the Procedure By-law and ask a third round of questions to staff.

*CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY*

* * * * *

Council heard from 36 speakers on the 2023 Draft Operating Budget; two who spoke in support of the recommendations with suggestions, 11 who spoke in opposition to the recommendations, and 23 who identified their position as other and spoke to other aspects of the recommendations.

* * * * *

During the hearing of speakers, it was

MOVED by Councillor Dominato
SECONDED by Councillor Bligh

THAT Council extend the meeting past 12 pm in order to finish hearing from public body representative speaker 1.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY

* * * * *

Council recessed at 11:54 am and reconvened at 1:03 pm.

* * * * *

During the hearing of speakers, it was

MOVED by Councillor Klassen
SECONDED by Councillor Zhou

THAT Council extend the meeting past 5 pm in order to hear from all remaining speakers.

WITHDRAWN

* * * * *

Prior to the vote on the motion above, it was

MOVED by Councillor Klassen
SECONDED by Councillor Zhou

THAT the motion to extend to hear from all speakers be withdrawn.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

* * * * *

MOVED by Councillor Klassen
SECONDED by Councillor Dominato

THAT Council extend the meeting to 5:30 pm to continue to hear from speakers.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

* * * * *

Council recessed at 5:26 pm and reconvened at 6:31 pm.

* * * * *

At this point in the proceedings, it was

MOVED by Councillor Boyle
SECONDED by Councillor Klassen

THAT Council proceed to discussion, debate and decision on Item 1 - 2023 Draft
Operating Budget.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

* * * * *

MOVED by Councillor Kirby-Yung
SECONDED by Councillor Dominato

- A. THAT Council approve the following increases to the Vancouver Police Board (VPB) Operating Budget, as outlined in the 2023 Draft Operating Budget section of Appendix A of this report:
- a) \$8.0 million additional funding for enabling the requisitioning and hiring new police officers, implementing Council's direction to hire 100 new police officers;
 - b) \$7.8 million additional funding driven by estimated increases in fixed costs such as compensation and benefit expenses, fleet expenses and increases in recoverable overtime and other expenditures;
 - c) \$7.3 million increase over the 2022 budget for permanent funding of 2021 VPD budget appeal, approved by the Province of BC, as well as new requirements from the Justice Institute of British Columbia (JIBC) recruit training; and
 - d) \$5.1 million increase for third party costs related to non-emergency call taking services provided by E Comm 9-1-1;

AND THAT the above constitutes Council's approval of the Vancouver Police Board 2023 Operating Budget of \$398,242,456 in expenditures and transfers and \$28,272,123 in revenues as outlined in the operating budget section of Appendix A of this report.

- B. THAT Council approve the Vancouver Board of Parks and Recreation 2023 Draft Operating Budget of \$154,841,143 in expenditures and transfers and \$71,094,900 in fee and program revenues as outlined in the operating budget section of Appendix A of this report.
- C. THAT Council approve the Vancouver Public Library Board 2023 Operating Budget of \$58,655,739 in expenditures and transfers and \$4,310,300 in fee and program revenues as outlined in the operating budget section of the operating budget section of Appendix A of this report.

- D. THAT Council approve the 2023 Property Endowment Fund (PEF) Operating Budget of \$57,471,717 in revenues and \$57,471,717 in expenses (including transfers) as outlined in Appendix A of this report.
- E. THAT Council approve the 2023 VAHEF Operating Budget of \$12,821,399 in revenues and \$12,821,399 in expenses (including transfers) as outlined in Appendix A of this report.
- F. THAT, subject to approval of recommendations A to E, or as amended, Council approve the 2023 Draft Operating Budget of \$1,961,363,868 outlined in Appendix A, resulting in an overall property tax increase of 9.7%, and direct staff to bring forward for adoption by Council a resolution consistent with the above approval to authorize the 2023 General Purposes Tax Levy in accordance with the Vancouver Charter.
- G. THAT Council direct Staff to develop strategies to address cost pressures in the multi-year financial plan through new revenue opportunities, process improvements to reduce costs or increase capacity, senior government funding and partnerships that will inform the multi-year property tax increases for Council's consideration as part of future Budget processes.

amended

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Kirby-Yung
SECONDED by Councillor Klassen

THAT the motion be amended by adding the following below (to be inserted into the letters of the Original Motion, A to G as appropriate, and new letters added as necessary):

THAT Council make the following investments and provide the following direction for the 2023 Operating Budget:

1. \$4.19 million for Vancouver Fire and Rescue Services to fund 33 new positions in 2023, to implement the recommendations for Year 4 of the VFRS growth plan to be funded by an increase in property tax.
2. THAT Council request VFRS to commence the next external third-party-led operational review to be managed within the existing VFRS operating budget.
3. \$0.3 million in ongoing funding for Engineering Services to increase the number of pothole crews from 5 to 6 (2 FTE) to increase road maintenance and pothole repair, and \$0.13 million in one-time funding for a vehicle and equipment, both funded by an increase in property tax.
4. \$0.6 million for Engineering Services to increase horticulture service levels funded by an increase in property tax.

5. THAT Council direct staff to include a dedicated line item for snow readiness and response within the Engineering Services budget by reallocating funding for that purpose within the existing budget (total \$1.8 million).
6. THAT Council direct staff to report back at the end of Q2 on the increased street cleaning work directed by Council in Chinatown and the DTES to inform what ongoing funding will be required in the future to continue to improve street cleanliness.
7. \$0.18 million for micro-cleaning grants to support plazas and parklets, funded by an increase in property tax.
8. \$0.11 million for the Vancouver Public Library to fund 1 position to provide training to build staff skills in crisis prevention and intervention, harassment, mental health and related areas, funded by an increase in property tax.
9. \$0.1 million for the Vancouver Public Library to provide ongoing funding for the conversion of branch materials-handling positions to public-service positions to be funded by an increase in property tax.
10. THAT Council direct staff to identify reallocations with the approved 2023 Planning, Urban Design, and Sustainability budget to provide \$0.2 million for a Seniors Planner.
11. \$0.3 million to ACCS to implement and address forthcoming Accessibility Legislation effective in 2023 and support work towards Vancouver becoming one of the world's most accessible cities, funded by an increase in property tax.
12. \$0.20 million for the Vancouver Police Department to fund a new Community Policing Centre in Mount Pleasant to be funded by an increase in property tax.
13. \$3.4 million for the Vancouver Police Department to provide funding to support the following items that were approved by the Vancouver Police Board as part of the provisional 2023 VPD Budget to be funded by additional property tax:
 - a. Digital Evidence Management System (DEMS) - \$747,500
 - b. Cell phones - \$415,500
 - c. Pilot for body-worn cameras – \$200,000
 - d. Community Policing Centres including establishing annual COLA adjustments – \$250,000
 - e. One-time Sworn overtime increase in recognition of the current unprecedented number of protests – \$969,468
 - f. One-time Statutory holiday pay for the new Truth + Reconciliation Day – \$670,000
 - g. Contract awards – \$100,000

- h. Operating impacts of capital and other city adjustments – \$39,598
- 14. \$0.21 million to complete outstanding work on Council motions on Gender Equity and Safety relating to Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls and Unsafe Spaces, funded by an increase in property tax.
- 15. THAT Council direct staff to identify reallocations within the approved 2023 ACCS budget to continue the department’s Anti-Black Racism and South Asian Cultural Redress work.
- 16. \$0.1 million for a Language Access Specialist position to enable ongoing implementation of the City’s Language Access Policy, funded by an increase in property tax.
- 17. Council direct staff to include options to reduce Chinatown on-street parking rates as part of a report back on parking, with the revenue impacts of reductions to be managed within the 2023 budget and incorporated into 2024 revenue projections.
- 18. THAT as part of the 2024 rate setting for development permit fees, staff provide options for a fee increase that would achieve 100% program cost recovery.
- 19. THAT as part of the 2024 rate setting for fees, including business licence fees, dog licence fees, food truck licence fees, permit parking fees, and on-street parking, staff provide options for increasing fee levels.
- 20. THAT Council direct staff to include options to increase service levels of washrooms in the City as part of the Washroom Strategy report back by the end of Q2 2023.

carried

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Boyle
SECONDED by Councillor Carr

THAT 8 be struck and replaced with the following:

\$445,000 for the Vancouver Public Library to support staff resilience by creating 3 social worker/community outreach positions; converting 22 branch staff positions from materials handling to public service and increasing staff hours in the most needed locations

FURTHER THAT 9 be struck and replaced with the following:

\$250,000 for the Vancouver Public Library to increase the number of branches that are open full days on Sundays and Mondays, beginning with 3-4 of the busiest branches that are currently not open full days.

AND FURTHER THAT 15 be struck and replaced with the following:

\$492,000 for ACCS related to Anti-Racism and Cultural Redress to support the continuation of work related to anti-Black racism, historical discrimination against people of South Asian descent, and intangible cultural heritage work in Chinatown, the Punjabi Market, Joyce-Collingwood and beyond.

LOST (Vote No. 09054)

(Councillors Bligh, Dominato, Kirby-Yung, Klassen, Meiszner, Montague, Zhou and Mayor Sim opposed)

* * * * *

At this point in the proceedings, Councillor Carr moved an amendment to the amendment, however, the Mayor noted it was not related to the amendment on the floor and advised her to move it as an amendment once the amendment on the floor was voted on. Councillor Carr agreed.

* * * * *

The amendment to the amendment having lost, Council agreed to separate the vote on the components of the amendment. Clause 4 was put and CARRIED (Vote No. 09055) with Councillor Fry opposed, Clause 13 (d)(f) was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 09056), Clause 13 (a)(b)(c)(e)(g)(h) was put and CARRIED (Vote No. 09057) with Councillors Boyle, Carr and Fry opposed, and the remaining clauses, 1 to 3, 5 to 12 and 14 to 20, were put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 09058).

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Carr
SECONDED by Councillor Boyle

THAT the motion be amended by adding the following:

\$6,622 (\$0.01 per resident) to hold in reserve for Vancouver's participation in a joint action B.C. municipalities lawsuit to Sue Big Oil, to be funded through staff re-allocation of funds within the Department of Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability.

LOST (Vote No. 09059)

(Councillors Bligh, Dominato, Kirby-Yung, Klassen, Meiszner, Montague, Zhou and Mayor Sim opposed)

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Dominato
SECONDED by Councillor Meiszner

THAT the following be added as I:

THAT Council request the Mayor write the Premier and Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General to advocate for provincial investment in restorative justice initiatives in Vancouver and across Metro Vancouver.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 09060)

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Dominato
SECONDED by Councillor Bligh

THAT the following be added as J:

THAT Council direct staff to report back in Q4 2023 with a Central Downtown Waterfront planning program and investment strategy, and include funding in the draft 2024 operating budget for this planning program.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 09061)

* * * * *

Council recessed at 7:52 pm and reconvened at 8:13 pm.

* * * * *

Prior to the vote, Council received a copy of the final wording of the amended motion that incorporated the amendments and changed the lettering of the original motion. Council agreed to separate the vote on the components of the amended motion. A(a) was put and CARRIED (Vote No. 09062) with Councillors Boyle, Carr and Fry opposed, A(b)(c)(d)(e)(f) was put and CARRIED (Vote No. 09063) with Councillor Boyle opposed, and B to J was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 09064).

FINAL MOTION AS APPROVED

Note: the final motion below has changes in the original lettering to reflect the approved amendments.

- A. THAT Council approve the following increases to the Vancouver Police Board (VPB) Operating Budget, as outlined in the 2023 Draft Operating Budget section of Appendix A of the Report dated February 14, 2023, entitled "2023 Draft Operating Budget":
 - a) \$8.0 million additional funding for enabling the requisitioning and hiring new police officers, implementing Council's direction to hire 100 new police officers;
 - b) \$7.8 million additional funding driven by estimated increases in fixed costs such as compensation and benefit expenses, fleet expenses and increases in recoverable overtime and other expenditures;
 - c) \$7.3 million increase over the 2022 budget for permanent funding of 2021 VPD budget appeal, approved by the Province of BC, as well as new

requirements from the Justice Institute of British Columbia (JIBC) recruit training; and

- d) \$5.1 million increase for third party costs related to non-emergency call taking services provided by E Comm 9-1-1.
- e) \$0.20 million for the Vancouver Police Department to fund a new Community Policing Centre in Mount Pleasant to be funded by an increase in property tax.
- f) \$3.4 million for the Vancouver Police Department to provide funding to support the following items that were approved by the Vancouver Police Board as part of the provisional 2023 VPD Budget to be funded by additional property tax:
 - i. Digital Evidence Management System (DEMS) - \$747,500
 - ii. Cell phones - \$415,500
 - iii. Pilot for body-worn cameras – \$200,000
 - iv. Community Policing Centres including establishing annual COLA adjustments – \$250,000
 - v. One-time Sworn overtime increase in recognition of the current unprecedented number of protests – \$969,468
 - vi. One-time Statutory holiday pay for the new Truth + Reconciliation Day – \$670,000
 - vii. Contract awards – \$100,000
 - viii. Operating impacts of capital and other city adjustments – \$39,598

AND THAT the above constitutes Council's approval of the Vancouver Police Board 2023 Operating Budget of \$401,834,522 in expenditures and transfers and \$28,272,123 in revenues as outlined in the operating budget section of Appendix A of the above-noted report.

- B. THAT Council approve the Vancouver Board of Parks and Recreation 2023 Draft Operating Budget of \$154,841,143 in expenditures and transfers and \$71,094,900 in fee and program revenues as outlined in the operating budget section of Appendix A of the Report dated February 14, 2023, entitled "2023 Draft Operating Budget".
- C. THAT Council approve \$0.11 million for the Vancouver Public Library to fund one position to provide training to build staff skills in crisis prevention and intervention, harassment, mental health and related areas, funded by an increase in property tax;

FURTHER THAT Council approve \$0.1 million for the Vancouver Public Library to provide ongoing funding for the conversion of branch materials-handling positions to public-service positions to be funded by an increase in property tax;

AND FURTHER THAT Council approve the Vancouver Public Library Board 2023 Operating Budget of \$58,868,739 in expenditures and transfers and

\$4,310,300 in fee and program revenues as outlined in the operating budget section of the operating budget section of Appendix A of the Report dated February 14, 2023, entitled "2023 Draft Operating Budget".

- D. THAT Council approve the 2023 Property Endowment Fund (PEF) Operating Budget of \$57,471,717 in revenues and \$57,471,717 in expenses (including transfers) as outlined in Appendix A of the Report dated February 14, 2023, entitled "2023 Draft Operating Budget".
- E. THAT Council approve the 2023 VAHEF Operating Budget of \$12,821,399 in revenues and \$12,821,399 in expenses (including transfers) as outlined in Appendix A of the Report dated February 14, 2023, entitled "2023 Draft Operating Budget".
- F. THAT Council make the following investments and provide the following direction for the 2023 Operating Budget:
 - i. To provide \$4.19 million to fund 33 new positions in 2023, to implement the recommendations for Year 4 of the VFRS growth plan to be funded by an increase in property tax.
 - ii. To request VFRS to commence the next external third-party-led operational review to be managed within the existing VFRS operating budget.
 - iii. \$0.3 million in ongoing funding for Engineering Services to increase the number of pothole crews from 5 to 6 (2 FTE) to increase road maintenance and pothole repair, and \$0.13 million in one-time funding for a vehicle and equipment, both funded by an increase in property tax.
 - iv. \$0.6 million for Engineering Services to increase horticulture service levels funded by an increase in property tax.
 - v. THAT Council direct staff to include a dedicated line item for snow readiness and response within the Engineering Services budget by reallocating funding for that purpose within the existing budget (total \$1.8 million).
 - vi. THAT Council direct staff to report back at the end of Q2 on the increased street cleaning work directed by Council in Chinatown and the DTES to inform what ongoing funding will be required in the future to continue to improve street cleanliness.
 - vii. \$0.18 million for micro-cleaning grants to support plazas and parklets, funded by an increase in property tax.
 - viii. THAT Council direct staff to identify reallocations with the approved 2023 Planning, Urban Design, and Sustainability budget to provide \$0.2 million for a Seniors Planner.

- ix. \$0.3 million to ACCS to implement and address forthcoming Accessibility Legislation effective in 2023 and support work towards Vancouver becoming one of the world's most accessible cities, funded by an increase in property tax.
 - x. \$0.21 million to complete outstanding work on Council motions on Gender Equity and Safety relating to Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls and Unsafe Spaces, funded by an increase in property tax.
 - xi. THAT Council direct staff to identify reallocations within the approved 2023 ACCS budget to continue the department's Anti-Black Racism and South Asian Cultural Redress work.
 - xii. \$0.1 million for a Language Access Specialist position to enable ongoing implementation of the City's Language Access Policy, funded by an increase in property tax.
 - xiii. Council direct staff to include options to reduce Chinatown on-street parking rates as part of a report back on parking, with the revenue impacts of reductions to be managed within the 2023 budget and incorporated into 2024 revenue projections.
 - xiv. THAT as part of the 2024 rate setting for development permit fees, staff provide options for a fee increase that would achieve 100% program cost recovery.
 - xv. THAT as part of the 2024 rate setting for fees, including business licence fees, dog licence fees, food truck licence fees, permit parking fees, and on-street parking, staff provide options for increasing fee levels.
 - xvi. THAT Council direct staff to include options to increase service levels of washrooms in the city as part of the Washroom Strategy report back by the end of Q2 2023.
- G. THAT, subject to the amended A to F above, Council approve the 2023 Draft Operating Budget of \$1,971,178,934 outlined in Appendix A of the Report dated February 14, 2023, entitled "2023 Draft Operating Budget", resulting in an overall property tax increase of 10.7%, and direct staff to bring forward for adoption by Council a resolution consistent with the above approval to authorize the 2023 General Purposes Tax Levy in accordance with the Vancouver Charter.
- H. THAT Council direct staff to develop strategies to address cost pressures in the multi-year financial plan through new revenue opportunities, process improvements to reduce costs or increase capacity, senior government funding and partnerships that will inform the multi-year property tax increases for Council's consideration as part of future Budget processes.

- I. THAT Council request the Mayor write the Premier and Minister of Public Safety and Solicitor General to advocate for provincial investment in restorative justice initiatives in Vancouver and across Metro Vancouver.
- J. THAT Council direct staff to report back in Q4 2023 with a Central Downtown Waterfront planning program and investment strategy, and include funding in the draft 2024 operating budget for this planning program.

ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Councillor Klassen
SECONDED by Councillor Dominato

THAT the meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

The Special Council adjourned at 8:57 pm.

* * * * *