



REPORT

Report Date: October 20, 2021
Contact: Jason Olinek
Contact No.: 604.871.6479
RTS No.: 14755
VanRIMS No.: 08-2000-20
Meeting Date: December 9, 2021

TO: Vancouver City Council

FROM: General Manager, Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability in consultation with the Director of Legal Services

SUBJECT: Heritage Designation – 6237 Adera Street – C.S. Arnold Residence

RECOMMENDATION

- A. THAT Council add the building known as the C.S. Arnold Residence at 6237 Adera Street (PID 004-774-868; Lot 11 of Lot 3 Block 3 District Lot 526 Plan 5279 (the “site”)) to the Vancouver Heritage Register in the ‘B’ evaluation category.
- B. THAT Council instruct the Director of Legal Services to bring forward for enactment, pursuant to Sections 593 and 594 of the *Vancouver Charter*, a by-law to designate the structure and exterior of the building known as the C.S. Arnold Residence (the “heritage building”) as protected heritage property.
- C. THAT Recommendations A and B be adopted on the following conditions:
 - i. THAT the passage of the above resolution creates no legal rights for the applicant or any other person, or obligation on the part of the City and any expenditure of funds or incurring of costs in relation thereto is at the risk of the person making the expenditure or incurring the cost; and
 - ii. THAT the City and all its officials shall not in any way be limited or restricted in the exercise of their authority or discretion, regardless of when they are called upon to exercise such authority or discretion.

REPORT SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to seek Council approval to add the building at 6237 Adera Street, known as the C.S. Arnold Residence, to the Vancouver Heritage Register in the 'B' evaluation category, and to designate its structure and exterior as protected heritage property. The heritage building has been evaluated to be in excellent condition. This is a voluntary heritage designation requested by the owner of their own volition and compensation is not sought.

COUNCIL AUTHORITY/PREVIOUS DECISIONS

Pursuant to Section 582 of the *Vancouver Charter*, Council, by resolution, may establish a heritage register identifying real property that Council considers to be heritage property and, by resolution, to add such properties to the register from time to time.

Pursuant to Sections 593 and 594 of the *Vancouver Charter*, Council, by by-law, may designate real property, in whole or in part, as protected heritage property.

Pursuant to Section 595 of the *Vancouver Charter*, if sought, Council is required to compensate an owner of property being designated as a protected heritage property for any reduction in the market value of the property caused by the designation. Often this, along with additional compensation to offset rehabilitation costs incurred, is achieved by way of zoning relaxations so as to permit an otherwise impermissible development.

In this case of voluntary designation, the owner has waived their entitlement to compensation for the heritage designation, as described on page 4 of this report.

The proposed heritage designation of the heritage building requires Council approval at public hearing and by-law enactment pursuant to Sections 593 and 594 of the *Vancouver Charter*.

The following Council policies are applicable to this report:

- *Vancouver Heritage Program* (March 2020)
- *Heritage Policies* (March 2020)
- *Arbutus Ridge/Kerrisdale/Shaugnessy Community Vision* (November 2005)

CITY MANAGER'S/GENERAL MANAGER'S COMMENTS

The City Manager recommends approval of the foregoing.

REPORT

Strategic Analysis

Site and Context - The site consists of a parcel located in Kerrisdale in an area zoned RS-3 (see Figure 1), addressed as 6237 Adera Street. The heritage building is located near the centre of the site, which has a total area of 893.2 square metres (9614.3 square feet). There is a 6-metre (20-foot) lane at the rear of the site.



Figure 1: The site and the surrounding zoning

Heritage Value

Built in 1925, the C.S. Arnold Residence is valued for its Tudor Revival architectural style with English Storybook elements, as designed by architect R.T. Perry for Kerrisdale Home Builders Limited. It is also significant for its association with C.S. Arnold, an eminent lawyer and cemetery operator.

The C.S. Arnold Residence is valued as an intact representative example of the homes designed by architect R.T. Perry for five blocks of Adera Street between West 41st and West 49th Avenue, a subdivision developed by Kerrisdale Home Builders Limited in the 1920's. Perry's Tudor Revival designs with English Storybook elements were drawn from his solid grounding in the English Arts and Crafts, which he employed for houses and apartment buildings alike (see photographs in Appendix A).

In addition, social and cultural value is found with the long residency of Charles S. Arnold, lawyer and cemetery operator, who bought the house when it was new in 1925. Arnold was involved in a number of significant court cases throughout his long career, including the representation of Fred Deal, a Black man accused of killing Victoria Cross recipient and Vancouver police constable Robert McBeath in the 1920's. Throughout Deal's trial and subsequent appeal, Arnold worked to ensure his client had the opportunity to present a credible defence and not have the trial skewed by public sentiment and sensational reporting by the local

press. Apart from his law career, Arnold was the owner of two cemeteries in the greater Vancouver area, Forest Lawn and Ocean View Cemeteries.

Compatibility with Existing Zoning and Land Use Regulations and Community Plans

The Vancouver Heritage Program (VHP) was adopted by Council on March 10, 2020. The proposal to designate this heritage building is consistent with the VHP, particularly:

Goal 1: Recognize a diversity of heritage values

Strategic Directions:

- Protect heritage values and historic places based on principles of diversity, inclusivity, and equity, in a meaningful and respectful way
- Continue heritage conservation support for Vancouver Heritage Register-listed sites

In addition, the Arbutus Ridge/Kerrisdale/Shaghnessy (ARKS) Community Vision was adopted by Council on November 1, 2005. The proposal to designate this heritage building is consistent with the Vision, particularly:

13.2 Retain Buildings on the Vancouver Heritage Register (VHR)

For buildings listed in the VHR, the City should encourage retention by implementing additional incentives which are suitable in ARKS

The intent of the RS-3 District Schedule of the Zoning and Development By-law is to preserve and maintain the residential character of the RS-3 District. The conservation and long-term protection of the heritage building meets this intent and is consistent with the Council-adopted Vancouver Heritage Program and Arbutus Ridge/Kerrisdale/ Shaughnessy Community Vision.

Condition of the Heritage Building and Conservation Approach

The heritage building is in excellent condition. The owner has maintained the house, with only minor alterations being made over the years. Staff have reviewed the work, and have concluded that it was consistent with the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada*. The heritage building retains its original character, including form, windows and entry. No rehabilitation is proposed or necessary at this time.

Public/Civic Agency Input

On September 13, 2021, The Vancouver Heritage Commission recommended that the heritage building be added to the Vancouver Heritage Register in the 'B' evaluation category and supported the proposal to designate its structure and exterior as protected heritage property (Appendix B).

Financial Implications

As the owner of the heritage building has requested the heritage designation of their own volition and has waived their entitlement to compensation for this action, there are no financial implications arising from this proposal.

Legal

Section 595 of the *Vancouver Charter* requires that, if sought, Council must compensate an owner for any reduction in the market value caused by a heritage designation. In this case, the heritage designation is voluntary and the owner is not seeking compensation. They have indicated that they want the designation to ensure that the heritage building will be protected as a heritage property for the long-term. The owner has signed an agreement explicitly waiving any claim to future compensation as a result of the heritage designation of the heritage building, and that agreement has been registered on title to the site.

CONCLUSION

The approval of the addition of the heritage building known as the “C.S. Arnold Residence” at 6237 Adera Street to the Vancouver Heritage Register in the ‘B’ evaluation category, and the heritage designation of the structure and exterior, will ensure that the heritage building is protected from exterior alterations which affect its heritage value, and from demolition. The owner, who has brought forward this request to add the heritage building to the Heritage Register, and to voluntarily designate it as protected heritage property, has agreed to accept the heritage designation without any further compensation required. Therefore, it is recommended that Council approve the addition of the heritage building to the Vancouver Heritage Register and to approve the heritage designation of the structure and exterior of the heritage building.

* * * * *

PHOTOGRAPHS



Photo 1: Front elevation of 6237 Adera Street



Photo 2: North side elevation of 6237 Adera Street

6237 ADERA STREET – C.S. ARNOLD RESIDENCE
RESOLUTIONS OF THE VANCOUVER HERITAGE COMMISSION

On September 13, 2021, the Vancouver Heritage Commission passed the following motions:

RESOLVED

THAT the Commission support adding 6237 Adera Street to the Vancouver Heritage Register as a B-listing and that the VHR Evaluation be referred back to Staff to complete the necessary revisions.

RESOLVED

THAT the Commission support the designation of the exterior and structure of 6237 Adera Street, CS Arnold Residence as protected heritage property.

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE – 6237 ADERA STREET

DESCRIPTION

The C.S. Arnold Residence, 6237 Adera Street, is a Tudor Revival house of rough cast stucco and half-timbering situated on the west side of Adera Street between 46th and 47th Avenue in the Kerrisdale neighbourhood of Vancouver, BC

HERITAGE VALUE

Built in 1925, the C.S. Arnold Residence is significant as a representative example of the Tudor Revival designs produced by architect R.T. Perry for Kerrisdale Home Builders Limited and their Adera Street subdivision, and for its long association with noted lawyer C.S. Arnold.

The C.S. Arnold Residence is valued as an intact representative example of the Tudor Revival designs produced by architect R.T. Perry for five blocks of Adera Street between 41st and 49th Avenues, a subdivision developed by Kerrisdale Home Builders Limited in the 1920s. Perry's Tudor Revival designs were drawn from his solid grounding in the English Arts and Crafts, which he employed for houses and apartment buildings alike.

Social and cultural value is found with the long residency of lawyer and cemetery operator, Charles Arnold who bought the house new in 1925. Arnold, a colourful and busy lawyer, was involved in a number of significant court cases throughout his long career including the representation of Fred Deal, a Black man accused of killing Victoria Cross recipient and police constable Robert McBeath. Throughout the original trial and subsequent appeal, Arnold worked to ensure his client had the opportunity to present a credible defence and not have the trial skewed by public sentiment and sensational reporting by the local press. Apart from his law career, Arnold was the owner of Forest Lawn and Ocean View cemeteries.

CHARACTER-DEFINING ELEMENTS

The elements that define the heritage character of the C.S. Arnold Residence are:

- its continuous residential use
- the form, scale, massing and details of a Tudor Revival style house with:
 - steep-pitched offset gable with half-timbering, incorporating an arched entry under the curve of the low edge of the roof line
 - the lower curve of the roof which extends along the north facade forming a covered passage
 - roughcast stucco cladding
 - timber-framed front porch with hipped roof and round top front door
 - front-facing dormer with vertical half-timbering
 - original window openings and assemblies with 10-light casement windows
 - chimney on the south side, centred on the roof peak
 - symmetrical southern façade with windows divided by the centrally-placed chimney
 - tongue and groove soffits with exposed rafter tails
 - cedar shingle roof
 - raised ground level and landscaping of the front yard designed to hide the house's true height from the street

DRAFT DESIGNATION BY-LAW – 6237 ADERA STREET

6237 Adera Street
(C.S. Arnold Residence)

BY-LAW NO. _____

**A By-law to designate certain real property
as protected heritage property**

THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF VANCOUVER, in public meeting, enacts as follows:

1. Council considers that the real property described as:

Structure and exterior envelope
and exterior building materials of
the heritage building
(C.S. Arnold Residence)

6237 Adera Street,
Vancouver, B.C.

PID: 004-774-868
Lot 11 of Lot 3 Block 3
District Lot 526 Plan
5279

has heritage value or heritage character, and that its designation as protected heritage property is necessary or desirable for its conservation.

2. Council designates the real property described in section 1 of this By-law as protected heritage property under Section 593 of the *Vancouver Charter*.

3. This By-law is to come into force and take effect on the date of its enactment.

ENACTED by Council this _____ day of _____, 2021

Mayor

City Clerk