



REPORT TO COUNCIL

STANDING COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL ON CITY FINANCE AND SERVICES

DECEMBER 5 AND 12, 2018

A Regular Meeting of the Standing Committee of Council on City Finance and Services was held on Wednesday, December 5, 2018, at 9:37 am, in the Council Chamber, Third Floor, City Hall. Subsequently, the meeting reconvened on Wednesday, December 12, 2018 at 9:37 am.

PRESENT:

- Councillor Melissa De Genova, Chair
- Mayor Kennedy Stewart
- Councillor Rebecca Bligh
- Councillor Christine Boyle
- Councillor Adriane Carr*
- Councillor Lisa Dominato*
- Councillor Pete Fry, Vice-Chair
- Councillor Colleen Hardwick
- Councillor Sarah Kirby-Yung
- Councillor Jean Swanson*
- Councillor Michael Wiebe*

CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE: Sadhu Johnston, City Manager
Paul Mochrie, Deputy City Manager

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Rosemary Hagiwara, Deputy City Clerk
Nicole Ludwig, Meeting Coordinator

* Denotes absence for a portion of the meeting

WELCOME

The Chair acknowledged we are on the unceded territories of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh Nations and we thank them for having cared for this land since time immemorial.

1. **2018 Climate Change Adaptation Strategy Update November 6, 2018**

The General Manager of Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability, introduced the five-year update to the Climate Change Adaptation Strategy, and introduced Tamsin Mills, Senior Sustainability Specialist, who provided an overview of the strategy and current and future climate issues. They, along with the General Manager of Development, Buildings and Licensing, the General Manager of Engineering Services, the City Manager and the Director of Sustainability, responded to questions.

The Committee heard from one speaker in support of the recommendations.

MOVED by Councillor Carr
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

- A. THAT Council approve in principle the 2018-2023 Action Plan incorporated in the Climate Change Adaptation Strategy, generally as shown included as Appendix A of the Policy Report dated November 6, 2018, entitled “2018 Climate Change Adaptation Strategy Update”, and direct staff to begin implementation of the highest priority actions. Staff will seek Council approval of programs and projects that require policy change and/or result in financial implications that cannot be accommodated in existing operating and capital budgets.
- B. THAT staff report back in five years with an update to the Strategy and/or Action Plan that incorporates the latest climate projections in step with new emissions pathways available from the International Panel on Climate Change.

amended

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Kirby-Yung

THAT the words “back in five years with an update” be replaced in B with “report back annually with progressive updates to”.

carried

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the amendment be amended as follows:

- replace the words “progressive updates” with the words “progress reports”
- insert the phrase “and in five years with a full update to” following the words “progress reports”.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03576)

The amendment to the amendment having carried, the amendment as amended was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03577)

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Fry

THAT the following be added as C to the motion:

THAT annual and five-year findings and projections are included in emerging and future city-wide planning and local Official Development Plans (ODPs).

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03579)

The amendments having carried, the motion as amended was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03580)

FINAL MOTION AS APPROVED

- A. THAT Council approve in principle the 2018-2023 Action Plan incorporated in the Climate Change Adaptation Strategy, generally as shown included as Appendix A of the Policy Report dated November 6, 2018, entitled “2018 Climate Change Adaptation Strategy Update”, and direct staff to begin implementation of the highest priority actions. Staff will seek Council approval of programs and projects that require policy change and/or result in financial implications that cannot be accommodated in existing operating and capital budgets.
- B. THAT staff report back annually with progress reports and in five years, with a full update to the Climate Change Adaptation Strategy and/or Action Plan that incorporates the latest climate projections in step with new emissions pathways available from the International Panel on Climate Change.
- C. THAT annual and five-year findings and projections are included in emerging and future city-wide planning and local Official Development Plans (ODPs).

2. Water Use in Buildings: Enhanced Public Safety, Efficiency and Long-Term Resiliency Measures November 19, 2018

The General Manager of Development, Buildings and Licensing, provided introductory comments, and along with the Chief Building Official, and staff from Engineering Services, presented the report.

Council heard from four speakers who expressed concerns with the recommendations, and a speaker from Vancouver Coastal Health who was generally supportive of the recommendations.

* * * * *

At approximately noon on December 5, 2018, it was

MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the length of the meeting be extended to complete the business on the agenda.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY**

MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the Committee conclude hearing from speakers on item 2 and recess for one hour; subsequently, the Committee will ask questions of staff then proceed with debate and decision on item 2.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

On At 12:40 pm, following the hearing of speakers it was

MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the meeting recess and reconvene in one hour.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

On December 5, 2018, the Committee recessed at 12:40 pm and reconvened at 1:58 pm.

* * * * *

The General Manager of Development, Buildings and Licensing, and the General Manager of Engineering Services, along with staff from Engineering Services, responded to questions.

MOVED by Councillor Fry

THAT the Committee recommend to Council

- A. THAT Council approve, in principle, the amendments to the Building By-law generally in the form attached as Appendix B of the Policy Report dated November 19, 2018, entitled "Water Use in Buildings: Enhanced Public Safety, Efficiency and Long-Term Resiliency Measures", implementing improvements to various plumbing fixtures and building mechanical systems.
- B. THAT Council instruct the Director of Legal Services to bring forward for enactment amendments to the Building By-law as set out in Appendix B of the Policy Report dated November 19, 2018, entitled "Water Use in Buildings: Enhanced Public Safety, Efficiency and Long-Term Resiliency Measures", with certain provisions to come into force and take effect on January 1, 2019, June 3, 2019, January 1, 2020 and July 1, 2020.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03581)
(Councillor Carr absent for the vote)

3. 2018 Temporary Modular Housing Homelessness Action Week Grants October 25, 2018

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred this matter to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services Meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers.

The registered speaker was not present.

The Director of Affordable Housing responded to questions.

At 2:43 pm, Councillor Fry declared conflict of interest on this matter as he has served on the board of one of the recipient organizations. He left the room and did not return until the conclusion of the vote on this item.

MOVED by Councillor Kirby-Yung
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

- A. THAT Council approve the Temporary Modular Housing Homelessness Action Week (TMH HAW) Grants in the individual amounts, and to five organizations, outlined in Appendix A of the administrative Report dated October 25, 2018, entitled "2018 Temporary Modular Housing Homelessness Action Week Grants" (\$15,000 in aggregate); source of funds to be the Arts, Culture and Community Services (ACCS) 2018 Operating Budget for Homelessness Services.
- B. THAT, pursuant to Section 206(1)(j) of the *Vancouver Charter*, Council deem the organizations listed in Appendix A of the Administrative Report dated October 25, 2018, entitled "2018 Temporary Modular Housing Homelessness Action Week Grants" which are not otherwise a registered charity with Canada Revenue Agency to be contributing to the health and welfare of the city.
- C. THAT all grants be subject to each approved recipient organization executing and delivering a grant agreement (or signing and returning a grant letter agreeing in writing to its terms).
- D. THAT all grant agreements and/or grant approval letters be on the terms generally outlined in the Administrative Report dated October 25, 2018, entitled "2018 Temporary Modular Housing Homelessness Action Week Grants" and otherwise satisfactory to the General Manager Arts, Culture and Community Services and City Solicitor.
- E. THAT, the General Manager Arts, Culture and Community Services be authorized to execute all grant approval letters, and the City Solicitor be authorized to execute all grant agreements, on behalf of the City.
- F. THAT no legal rights or obligations are created by the approval of A, B and C above unless and until an actual grant agreement (or letter agreement) is executed and delivered by the City and the approved recipient organization.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY (Vote No. 03582)

**4. 2019 Land Assessment Averaging: Notice to BC Assessment Authority
October 29, 2018**

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred this matter to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services Meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers.

Registered speakers withdrew prior to the meeting.

The Director of Long Term Financial Strategy and Planning responded to questions.

MOVED by Councillor Wiebe

THAT the Committee recommend to Council

- A. THAT, pursuant to Section 374.4 (4b) of the *Vancouver Charter*, the City Clerk be instructed to notify the BC Assessment Authority ("BC Assessment"), before January 1, 2019, of Vancouver City Council's intent to consider the adoption of targeted land assessment averaging for the purpose of property tax calculations for 2019.
- B. THAT the Director of Finance be instructed to provide the required two weeks notice to the public in advance of Council's consideration of the use of targeted land assessment averaging and, before March 31, 2019, report on the projected taxation impacts of the program based on the assessed values provided by BC Assessment in the 2019 Completed Roll.
- C. THAT the Area Assessor for Vancouver be invited to address Council on the 2019 assessment trends.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03583)

5. Conflict of Interest Rules

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred this motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers.

The registered speaker withdrew their request to speak.

MOVED by Mayor Stewart

THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. When an elected official or senior staff leaves their City Hall office and takes a new role with a firm that does business with the City, it undermines the special position of trust with the public that senior staff have;
2. Elected officials and senior civil servants have valuable knowledge and relationships that can potentially create unfair and profitable advantage for new employers simply because of the position they currently occupy with the City;
3. Lobbyists currently have unchecked access to decision-makers and the City's conflict of interest rules are out-of-date and toothless;
4. Conflict of interest rules improve public confidence in municipal governance;
5. Current City of Vancouver Code of Conduct prohibits employees from relaying confidential information for the purpose of securing a private benefit for themselves or for any other person, and requires avoidance of voting on issues when they personally think they are in conflict, but does not address conflict of interest post-employment or for family members; and

6. Federal, provincial, and other city governments have longstanding conflict of interest legislation.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT staff be directed to report back to Council regarding how the City can improve its current Conflict of Interest policy including consideration of the following:

- i. Requirements for elected officials and their spouses to proactively disclose assets, liabilities, and financial interests;
- ii. Prohibitions on elected officials from engaging in employment, practicing a profession, carrying on a business, or holding an office or directorship, if these activities are likely to conflict with their public duties;
- iii. Prohibitions on elected officials and key staff members from accepting City of Vancouver contracts or lobbying for 12 months after leaving their positions;
- iv. How current and new regulations will be administered and monitored, including through a new and independent office; and
- v. An assessment of associated costs and delivery timelines.

carried

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Dominato

THAT ii. be amended as follows:

- Strike the words “prohibitions” and insert “Any requirements for”;
- Delete the words “from engaging in” and inserting the words “to submit public bi-annual disclosures including but not limited to:”;
- Delete the phrase “if these activities are likely to conflict with their public duties”;
- Add the sentence “Furthermore that City of Vancouver Legal Services review all Council members’ disclosures and provide high-level legal advice regarding any concerns that may arise regarding possible Conflict of interest”;

FURTHER THAT iii. be amended as follows:

- Delete the words “Prohibitions on” and insert the “Any recommendations restricting”;
- Inserting the words “employees and” following the phrase “City of Vancouver”;
- Delete the word “or” and insert the words “working for another municipality within the region”;

FURTHER THAT the following be added as vi.:

- Any legal considerations for the City of Vancouver in making changes to its Conflict of Interest policy.

FURTHER THAT the following be added as B to the motion:

- THAT the Mayor, on behalf of Council, bring forward a motion at Metro Vancouver, and put forward a resolution at the Union of BC Municipalities, and the Big City Mayors' Caucus, encouraging other municipalities to consider adopting a similar Conflict of Interest resolution.

carried

* * * * *

MOVED by Mayor Stewart

THAT the Committee recess briefly in order to review the amendment.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

On December 5, 2018, the Committee recessed at 3:08 and reconvened at 3:15 pm.

* * * * *

When the Committee reconvened, the amendment was put and **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY** (Vote. No. 03584) and the motion as amended was put and **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY** (Vote No. 03585)

FINAL MOTION AS APPROVED

WHEREAS

1. When an elected official or senior staff leaves their City Hall office and takes a new role with a firm that does business with the City, it undermines the special position of trust with the public that senior staff have;
2. Elected officials and senior civil servants have valuable knowledge and relationships that can potentially create unfair and profitable advantage for new employers simply because of the position they currently occupy with the City;
3. Lobbyists currently have unchecked access to decision-makers and the City's conflict of interest rules are out-of-date and toothless;
4. Conflict of interest rules improve public confidence in municipal governance;
5. Current City of Vancouver Code of Conduct prohibits employees from relaying confidential information for the purpose of securing a private benefit for themselves or for any other person, and requires avoidance of voting on issues when they personally think they are in conflict, but does not address conflict of interest post-employment or for family members; and
6. Federal, provincial, and other city governments have longstanding conflict of interest legislation.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT staff be directed to report back to Council regarding how the City can improve its current Conflict of Interest policy including consideration of the following:
- i. Requirements for elected officials and their spouses to proactively disclose assets, liabilities, and financial interests;
 - ii. Any requirements for elected officials to submit public bi-annual disclosures including but not limited to: employment, practicing a profession, carrying on a business, or holding an office or directorship that could conflict with their public duties. Furthermore, that City of Vancouver legal, review all Council members disclosures and provide high-level legal advice regarding any concerns that may arise; regarding possible Conflict of Interest;
 - iii. Any recommendations restricting elected officials and City of Vancouver employees and key staff members from accepting City of Vancouver contracts, lobbying or working for another municipality within the region 12 months of leaving their positions;
 - iv. How current and new regulations will be administered and monitored, including through a new and independent office;
 - v. An assessment of associated costs and delivery timelines; and
 - vi. Any legal considerations for the City of Vancouver in making changes to its Conflict of Interest policy.
- B. THAT the Mayor, on behalf of Council, bring forward a motion at Metro Vancouver, and put forward a resolution at the Union of BC Municipalities, and the Big City Mayors' Caucus, encouraging other municipalities to consider adopting a similar Conflict of Interest resolution.

6. Lobbyist Registry for the City of Vancouver

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred the following motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers.

The registered speaker withdrew their request to speak.

MOVED by Mayor Stewart
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. The public has an increasing interest in greater transparency in government and the City of Vancouver has been at the forefront of efforts to increase access to information, including establishing the first open data policy for a major city in Canada;

2. Lobbyist registries are intended to provide a public record that is accessible to residents of interactions between public servants, elected officials and lobbyists and to allow for rules regarding lobbyists to be enforced;
3. Previous Councils have repeatedly asked staff to investigate options for creating a municipal lobbyist registry between 2006 and 2017;
4. British Columbia does not currently allow municipalities to use the provincial lobbyist registry nor does it extend the legal authorities municipalities would need to enforce lobbyist rules with a local registry;
5. In 2017, City staff produced a memo on February 8, 2017 for the previous council outlining options for how the Province can provide the City with the ability to register lobbyists, create rules for lobbyist's conduct in their interactions with elected officials and public servants, and the ability to enforce those rules;
6. On February 21, 2017, the previous Council unanimously adopted a motion that was then submitted as a resolution to the 2017 Union of BC Municipalities convention asking the Province to provide municipalities with the ability to register lobbyists, create rules for lobbyists' conduct in their interactions with elected officials and public servants, and the ability to enforce those rules;
7. The City's resolution was successfully adopted by Union of BC Municipalities delegates in September 2017 and forwarded to the Province for response; and
8. The most recent response by the Province in February 2018 to the 2017 UBCM resolution affirmed the Province is willing to discuss the matter further.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the City of Vancouver request the Province immediately take one of the following two actions in response to the resolutions adopted by the previous Council and Union of BC Municipalities in 2017 regarding the regulation of municipal lobbyists:

- i) The Province amend the *Lobbyist Registration Act* to cover the City of Vancouver and administer the regulation of lobbying in the City; OR,
- ii) The Province amend the *Vancouver Charter* to allow the City to establish a lobbyist registry and give the City the legal authority to register lobbyists, create rules for lobbyists' conduct in their interactions with elected officials and public servants, as well as the power to enforce those rules. In addition, the Province further empower the Provincial Registrar of Lobbyists to work with the City to share information so as to reduce duplication and costs for both levels of government.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03856)

7. Possible Amendments to By-law 6066 to Allow for Safe and Licensed Ride Sharing in Vancouver

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred the following Motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers.

At 3:31 pm, Councillor De Genova relinquished the Chair to participate in debate. Councillor Fry assumed the chair.

The Committee heard from two speakers who expressed concerns with the motion pertaining to licensing and competition with existing taxi services, and four speakers in support of the motion.

MOVED by Councillor De Genova
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. Vancouver is currently the largest city in North America that does not offer ride-sharing (ride-hailing) services like Uber or Lyft;
2. MADD (Mothers Against Drunk Drivers) Canada and Barwatch are among several associations and organizations that are calling for ride-share in the city of Vancouver;
3. "Ride Sharing Now For BC" represents more than 30 local organizations calling for ride-sharing in British Columbia including Able BC, Barwatch, BC Chamber of Commerce, BC Epilepsy Society, BC Restaurants and Food Services Association, BC Tech Association, Business Council of British Columbia, Canadian National Institute for the Blind, Downtown Vancouver Business Improvement Association, Greater Vancouver Board of Trade, Harbour Air, Hospitality Vancouver Association, Mothers Against Drunk Drivers (MADD) , Restaurants Canada, Vancouver Economic Commission, Vancouver Pride Society, Vision Loss Rehabilitation Canada;
4. The February 2018 report on Transportation Network Companies from The Standing Committee on Crown Corporations, of the Legislative Assembly of British Columbia cites the measures other cities and provinces have taken in consideration of safety and insurance when implementing ride sharing and ride hailing services;
5. The Insurance Corporation of British Columbia (ICBC), requires all drivers to purchase Basic Autoplan insurance coverage, while additional insurance may be purchased from private insurance providers;
6. Tourists and travelers are unable to use the same app based ride-sharing services in Vancouver as they can in across Canada and 600 other cities around the world; and
7. The Entertainment District located in the city of Vancouver is unique to the region, and stakeholders have often voiced issues with late night transportation that is beyond what licensed taxis for hire can accommodate.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT the Mayor write a letter on behalf of Council to the Premier of BC, the Minister of Transportation, and Attorney General and Minister Responsible for ICBC:
- i) Affirming support for ride-sharing to be introduced alongside taxi cabs in the city of Vancouver in an equitable manner; and
 - ii) Calling for per kilometer ridesharing and taxi insurance products to be made available to companies by April 2019 in line with other changes the province is making to ICBC announced on November 9, 2018.
- B. THAT staff report back to Council with analysis and options for ride-sharing and ride-hailing so that Council can provide direction to staff. Subsequently, staff report back to Council with proposed by-law changes to allow for ride-sharing and ride-hailing and include information addressing:
- i) The ability of the City of Vancouver to amend or create by-laws to promote the inclusion and operation of companies offering on-demand ride-sharing and ride-hailing services; and
 - ii) The impact removing municipal boundaries for taxis, including accessible taxis, may have on serving the public and especially persons with disabilities in the city of Vancouver.

carried

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the following be added to B as iii)

The ability of the City of Vancouver to monitor and limit impacts of increased traffic and congestion resulting from the introduction of ride-sharing and ride-hailing, and consideration of how these increases might affect the goals and targets of the 2020 Greenest City Action Plan

amended

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor De Genova

THAT the word “these” replaced with the word “any”.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03587)

The amendment to the amendment having carried, the amendment as amended was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03589).

AMENDMENT MOVED by Mayor Stewart

THAT the phrase “including consideration for affordability and the impact on passenger safety; and” be inserted following the word “manner” in A(i);

FURTHER THAT the phrase “as well as options and implications for extending the lifespan of vehicles used by people living with disabilities”, be inserted following the phrase “City of Vancouver” in B(ii).

amended

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor De Genova

THAT the amendment be amended as follows:

- Replace the word “the” with “any possible” preceding the word “impact” in A(i); and
- Insert the words “any possible” between the words “and” and “implications” in B(ii).

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03590)

The amendment to the amendment having carried, the amendment as amended was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03591)

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Swanson

THAT the following be added to B as iv) and v):

- The possibility of setting up non-profit, municipal-owned, or co-op ride sharing owned by drivers, so that any surplus could be shared by drivers as higher wages and passengers as lower fares, rather than as profits for multinational corporations.

amended

- Affirming Council support for limiting the supply of ride-hailing vehicles to reduce traffic congestions and air pollution in the City of Vancouver.

not put

Councillor Carr rose on a point of order to note that proposed B v) is essentially the same as the previous amendment to the main motion. The Vice-Chair ruled B v) out of order.

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor De Genova

THAT the phrase “so that any surplus could be shared by drivers as higher wages and passengers as lower fares, rather than as profits for multinational corporations” be deleted from B iv).

CARRIED (Vote No. 03592)

(Councillors Boyle, Dominato, Hardwick, and Kirby-Yung opposed)

B v) having been ruled out of order and the amendment to the amendment having carried, the amendment as amended was put and CARRIED, with Councillor Kirby-Yung opposed to, and Councillor Hardwick abstaining from the vote (Vote No. 03593).

*(*Section 145.1 of the Vancouver Charter states “Where a member present at a meeting abstains from voting, they are deemed to have voted in the affirmative”.)*

The amendments having carried or been ruled out of order, the motion as amended was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03594)

FINAL MOTION AS APPROVED

WHEREAS

1. Vancouver is currently the largest city in North America that does not offer ride-sharing (ride-hailing) services like Uber or Lyft;
2. MADD (Mothers Against Drunk Drivers) Canada and Barwatch are among several associations and organizations that are calling for ride-share in the city of Vancouver;
3. "Ride Sharing Now For BC" represents more than 30 local organizations calling for ride-sharing in British Columbia including Able BC, Barwatch, BC Chamber of Commerce, BC Epilepsy Society, BC Restaurants and Food Services Association, BC Tech Association, Business Council of British Columbia, Canadian National Institute for the Blind, Downtown Vancouver Business Improvement Association, Greater Vancouver Board of Trade, Harbour Air, Hospitality Vancouver Association, Mothers Against Drunk Drivers (MADD), Restaurants Canada, Vancouver Economic Commission, Vancouver Pride Society, Vision Loss Rehabilitation Canada;
4. The February 2018 report on Transportation Network Companies from The Standing Committee on Crown Corporations, of the Legislative Assembly of British Columbia cites the measures other cities and provinces have taken in consideration of safety and insurance when implementing ride sharing and ride hailing services;
5. The Insurance Corporation of British Columbia (ICBC), requires all drivers to purchase Basic Autoplan insurance coverage, while additional insurance may be purchased from private insurance providers;
6. Tourists and travelers are unable to use the same app based ride-sharing services in Vancouver as they can in across Canada and 600 other cities around the world; and
7. The Entertainment District located in the city of Vancouver is unique to the region, and stakeholders have often voiced issues with late night transportation that is beyond what licensed taxis for hire can accommodate.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT the Mayor write a letter on behalf of Council to the Premier of BC, the Minister of Transportation, and Attorney General and Minister Responsible for the Insurance Corporation of British Columbia (ICBC):
 - i) Affirming support for ride-sharing to be introduced alongside taxi cabs in the city of Vancouver in an equitable manner; including consideration for affordability and any possible impact on passenger safety; and

- ii) Calling for per kilometer ridesharing and taxi insurance products to be made available to companies by April 2019 in line with other changes the province is making to ICBC announced on November 9, 2018.
- B. THAT staff report back to Council with analysis and options for ride-sharing and ride-hailing so that Council can provide direction to staff. Subsequently, staff report back with proposed by-law changes to allow for ride-sharing and ride-hailing and include information addressing:
- i) The ability of the City of Vancouver to amend or create by-laws to promote the inclusion and operation of companies offering on-demand ride-sharing and ride-hailing services;
 - ii) The impact removing municipal boundaries for taxis, including accessible taxis, may have on serving the public and especially persons with disabilities in the city of Vancouver, as well as options and any possible implications for extending the lifespan of vehicles used by people living with disabilities;
 - iii) The ability of the City of Vancouver to monitor and limit impacts of increased traffic and congestion resulting from the introduction of ride-sharing and ride-hailing, and consideration of how any increases might affect the goals and targets of the 2020 Greenest City Action Plan; and
 - iv) The possibility of setting up non-profit, municipal-owned, or co-op ride sharing owned by drivers.

* * * * *

On December 5, 2018, at 6 pm it was

MOVED by Councillor De Genova

THAT the Committee recess and reconvene in 30 minutes.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

The Committee recessed and reconvened at 6:40 pm.

* * * * *

8. Building a Family Friendly Vancouver: Affordable Child Care

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred the following motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers.

The registered speaker was not present.

MOVED by Councillor De Genova
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. Vancouver is facing an affordability crisis. A lack of affordable housing and affordable childcare are limiting the abilities of families to continue to live in the city of Vancouver;
2. In 2018, the Provincial Government released "Childcare B.C., Caring for Kids, Lifting up Families: The Path to Universal Childcare". The document states "Vancouver is one of the most expensive cities for Childcare with a median fee of \$1,250 per month for infant and toddler care". The document also commits to providing grants to local governments in British Columbia to support building new child care spaces and creating plans to inform local needs;
3. On June 26, 2018, The City of Vancouver issued a press release celebrating 1064 new child care spaces. On the City of Vancouver website, Mayor Gregor Robertson is stated as saying "Making sure that families have access to affordable childcare is a key part of building a healthy, inclusive city and helps set our kids up for success now and down the road";
4. The City of Vancouver Document "Technical Guidelines" published by Real Estate and Facilities Management in May of 2018 states that "Development Permits may be required for new childcare facilities. Building and Occupancy Permits are required for all new childcare facilities;
5. A Child Care Facility's childcare license will need to be obtained by the Childcare Operator from Community Care Facilities Licensing, a department of Vancouver Coastal Health, before an Occupancy Permit can be obtained. Nowhere in the document does it state that there is a policy to streamline and expedite the processes associated with permits and licensing for new childcare facilities;
6. The City of Vancouver Document "Steps for Establishing a Child Care Centre in an Existing Building", published by the Social Development Department was last updated in 2008;
7. The City of Vancouver website page "Developing a childcare centre" states "Staff work with developers, architects, landscape architects, and early childhood educators to make sure that every new center includes urban design best practices, and contributes to a child's mental and physical development". There is no mention of incentives or expediting the processes for childcare facilities in Vancouver;
8. On September 19, 2018, the motion entitled "Family Friendly Vancouver: Citywide Policy to Fast Track and Expedite Projects that include new Child Care Centres in the City of Vancouver" was referred to staff. It is anticipated that staff will report back to Council in June 2019;
9. On September 2018, the British Columbia Ministry of Children and Family Development issued a press release titled "Partnerships give B.C. families quicker access to child care". The release states "Municipal and regional government in B.C. are eligible for up to \$1 million per project through the new Community Child Care Space Creation Program. Priority will be given to projects

that build spaces that serve infants and toddlers, offer care outside of regular business hours, are operated by a public body or non-profit, and/or benefit underserved populations”; and

10. Phase 1 Actions of the Women’s Equity Strategy include “Identify child-friendly provisions to accommodate participation by families with children at Council and public hearings at City Hall.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT Council direct staff to formally contact the appropriate Ministry of Children and Family Development staff to discuss opportunities for the City of Vancouver to secure funding for future projects from the Community Child Care Space Creation Program and report back to Council within the potential for provincial funding.
- B. THAT Council direct staff to explore ways the City of Vancouver can work with organizations and agencies including Vancouver Coastal Health and the B.C. government to streamline and expedite the processes associated with permits and licensing for child care facilities in Vancouver.
- C. THAT Council direct staff to explore a program to create incentives for applicants to include child care in future developments and report back to Council in Spring of 2019; however, if funding from senior levels of government becomes available sooner, that staff prioritize and expedite a report and any recommendations to Council.
- D. THAT Council direct staff to consider purpose-built child care, including temporary structures similar to modular housing when appropriate;

FURTHER THAT staff consider requirements for child care facilities to be included; when appropriate, on any development of City-owned Land.

referred

REFERRAL MOVED by Councillor De Genova

THAT item 8 “Building a Family Friendly Vancouver: Affordable Child Care”, be referred to the Regular Council meeting on December 18, 2018, as Unfinished Business.”

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Following the conclusion of the vote on this item, Councillor De Genova assumed the Chair.

9. Land Value Capture in the City of Vancouver

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred the following Motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers. Due to time constraints, speakers were heard on December 5, 2018, and the decision was made on December 12, 2018.

The Committee heard from seven speakers in support of the motion.

* * * * *

On December 5, 2018, it was

MOVED by Councillor Bligh

THAT the Committee hear from as many speakers as possible tonight on the remaining agenda items, and postpone discussion and decision on those items to a reconvened meeting on Wednesday, December 12, 2018, at 9:30 am.

withdrawn

Councillor Bligh requested to withdraw her motion noted above. The Committee agreed.

POSTPONEMENT MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT Council postpone discussion and decision on item 9 "Land Value Capture in the City of Vancouver" to a reconvened Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on Wednesday, December 12, 2018, at 9:30 am."

CARRIED

(Councillor Swanson opposed)

* * * * *

In discussion, the Committee noted a number of speakers to item 12 were present in the Chamber.

MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the Committee recess briefly to ascertain how many speakers are present for the remaining items on the agenda.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

On December 5, 2018, the Committee recessed at 8:58 pm and reconvened at 9:05 pm.

Subsequently it was

MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the order of the agenda be varied in order to hear speakers on item 12 "A Proposed Alternative to Provincial Encroachment on the City of Vancouver's Municipal Tax Base" as the next item of business

*CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY*

Note: for ease of reference, the minutes are recorded in numerical order.

* * * * *

On December 12, 2018, the Committee considered the motion “Land Value Capture in the City of Vancouver”.

MOVED by Councillor Boyle
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. Land speculation has had a significant impact on increasing land values within Vancouver, deepening the city’s affordability crisis and putting a significant portion of housing out of reach at local incomes;
2. Rezoning, density increases and redevelopment also have a significant impact on increasing land values, including all the surrounding land immediately in the proximity of developed land;
3. Infrastructure projects in Vancouver, such as hospitals, new roads, new transit, parks, or other development decisions approved by the City, there is a dramatic increase in the value of surrounding land. That wealth is not captured but rather becomes a transfer of wealth from the public to private landowners;
4. The increase in land value due to market demand is not captured by anyone except the property owner, who may withhold development awaiting land value lift or rezoning, then capture the majority of the wealth with limited social benefit;
5. Vancouver is now one of the most expensive cities in the Western hemisphere, with a lack of available affordable housing, and a lack of sufficient financial tools for ensuring new housing is truly affordable for low and modest incomes;
6. Over the past 20-plus years, municipalities have experienced cost downloading from senior levels of government, including housing and social infrastructure, without new municipal finance tools or revenue to fund those costs;
7. A Land Value Capture (LVC) mechanism is designed to dampen speculation and generate revenue by measuring and ‘capturing’ a portion of the increase in land value (created by rezoning, public investments, etc) to direct toward public priorities;
8. LVC has the potential to be a more transparent method of capturing land value than Vancouver’s existing CAC system, and more accurate than Development Contribution Expectations (DCEs). Applied broadly, it decreases rampant land speculation and unfettered value increases, thus ensuring long term affordability;
9. The creation of a City Wide plan creates a timely opportunity to be exploring and implementing a municipally controlled financial mechanism such as a LVC; and
10. Some form of LVC is in use in about 25 countries around the world, including South Africa, Australia and New Zealand. A few jurisdictions in the U.S., mostly in Pennsylvania, also use a blended version that is partly a land value tax and

partly a buildings tax.¹ And Vancouver had a Land Value Tax from 1910 to 1984.²

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT Council direct staff to work with policy makers, researchers, and BC Assessment to explore how Council could create, adopt and consistently apply a land value capture mechanism to collect a percentage of the wealth being created by public decision makers in the City of Vancouver. This would include:
- i. Exploring how a LVC could work within, or replace, Vancouver's existing system of Community Amenities Contributions (CACs) and Development Contribution Expectations (DCEs) to reduce backlog in approval, and fairly capture the value of wealth created by land rezoning and public infrastructure projects;
 - ii. Determining the most appropriate time to set the baseline value and at which point during sale or redevelopment to capture the new value;
 - iii. Considering other factors including: the ideal percentage of value to capture, the impact on various property classifications, the potential revenue that would be generated, the impact on development, and the potential scope of the policy; and
 - vi. Outlining next steps for the City of Vancouver to work with the Province to develop a 'made-in-Vancouver' land value capture, and next steps for working with TransLink to model a land value capture mechanism for transit infrastructure investments, including partially funding an extension of the Broadway subway to UBC;
 - vii. Articulating clear jurisdictional expectations that ensure such a tool would remain within the control of the City, with revenue to go toward local priorities (including truly-affordable housing).
- B. THAT Council direct staff to report back to Council by May 2019 with their initial findings and recommendations.

amended

* * * * *

On December 12, 2018, the Committee recessed at 9:43 am and reconvened at 9:50 am.

* * * * *

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT A be amended by replacing the words: "explore how Council could create, adopt and consistently apply a land value capture mechanism to collect a percentage of the wealth being created by public decision makers in the City of Vancouver. This would include" with the following words:

¹ <https://earthsharing.ca/news/land-value-taxation-vancouver>

² England, Christopher. "Land Value Taxation in Vancouver: Rent Seeking and the Tax Revolt." *American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 77.1 (2018): 59-94.

assess current land value capture (LVC) mechanisms to collect on behalf of the public a percentage of the land value wealth being created by City of Vancouver decision making, including Community Amenity Contributions (CACs) and Development Cost Levies (DCLs), and explore the pros and cons of further LVC mechanisms, including looking at other jurisdictions.

FURTHER THAT parts Ai to Avii be deleted;

FURTHER THAT B be amended to delete the words “by May 2019” and parts i. to vi., and insert the phrase “with their initial findings and recommendations as part of their planned July 2019 report and review of Community Amenity Contributions.”

amended

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Fry

THAT the words “other stakeholders” be inserted in A following the word “researchers”.

CARRIED

(Councillors Hardwick and Kirby-Yung opposed)

(Councillor Dominato absent for the vote) (Vote No. 03599)

The amendment to the amendment having carried, the amendment as amended was put and CARRIED with Councillors Hardwick and Kirby-Yung opposed and Councillor Dominato absent for the vote (Vote No. 03600).

The amendment as amended having carried, the motion as amended was put and CARRIED with Councillors Hardwick and Kirby-Yung opposed and Councillor Dominato absent for the vote (Vote No. 03601)

FINAL MOTION AS APPROVED

WHEREAS

1. Land speculation has had a significant impact on increasing land values within Vancouver, deepening the city’s affordability crisis and putting a significant portion of housing out of reach at local incomes;
2. Rezoning, density increases and redevelopment also have a significant impact on increasing land values, including all the surrounding land immediately in the proximity of developed land;
3. Infrastructure projects in Vancouver, such as hospitals, new roads, new transit, parks, or other development decisions approved by the city, there is a dramatic increase in the value of surrounding land. That wealth is not captured but rather becomes a transfer of wealth from the public to private landowners;
4. The increase in land value due to market demand is not captured by anyone except the property owner, who may withhold development awaiting land value lift or rezoning, then capture the majority of the wealth with limited social benefit;

5. Vancouver is now one of the most expensive cities in the Western hemisphere, with a lack of available affordable housing, and a lack of sufficient financial tools for ensuring new housing is truly affordable for low and modest incomes;
6. Over the past 20-plus years, municipalities have experienced cost downloading from senior levels of government, including housing and social infrastructure, without new municipal finance tools or revenue to fund those costs;
7. A Land Value Capture (LVC) mechanism is designed to dampen speculation and generate revenue by measuring and 'capturing' a portion of the increase in land value (created by rezoning, public investments, etc) to direct toward public priorities;
8. LVC has the potential to be a more transparent method of capturing land value than Vancouver's existing CAC system, and more accurate than Development Contribution Expectations (DCEs). Applied broadly, it decreases rampant land speculation and unfettered value increases, thus ensuring long term affordability;
9. The creation of a City Wide plan creates a timely opportunity to be exploring and implementing a municipally controlled financial mechanism such as a LVC;
10. Some form of LVC is in use in about 25 countries around the world, including South Africa, Australia and New Zealand. A few jurisdictions in the U.S., mostly in Pennsylvania, also use a blended version that is partly a land value tax and partly a buildings tax.³ And Vancouver had a Land Value Tax from 1910 to 1984.⁴

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT Council direct staff to consult with policy makers, researchers, other stakeholders, and BC Assessment to assess current land value capture (LVC) mechanisms to collect on behalf of the public a percentage of the land value wealth being created by City of Vancouver decision making, including Community Amenity Contributions (CACs) and Development Cost Levies (DCLs), and explore the pros and cons of further LVC mechanisms, including looking at other jurisdictions.
- B. THAT Council direct staff to report back to Council with their initial findings and recommendations as part of their planned July 2019 report and review of Community Amenity Contributions.

10. Motion Calling for 600 More Units of Modular Housing in 2019

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred this motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers. Due to time constraints, speakers were heard on December 12, 2018, and the decision was made on the same day.

The Committee heard from two speakers in support of the motion.

³ <https://earthsharing.ca/news/land-value-taxation-vancouver>

⁴ England, Christopher. "Land Value Taxation in Vancouver: Rent Seeking and the Tax Revolt." *American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 77.1 (2018): 59-94.

*Note: at the Regular Council meeting, changes were made to the original Motion on Notice. Those changes are noted in **bold italics** below.*

MOVED by Councillor Swanson
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. 2181 homeless people were counted in Vancouver this year;
2. Homeless people have about half the life expectancy as housed people;
3. Being homeless causes suffering and poor health;
4. The City spends millions of dollars dealing with the impact of homelessness with shelters, outreach programs, street cleaning, etc.;
5. The BC government's Homes for BC plan promises an additional \$291 million in capital funding and \$216 million in operating funding for housing for homeless people over the 2018-2021 period;
6. Many people who get into modular homes feel they have won the lottery;
7. Hundreds of SRO residents face poor conditions, rent hikes, gentrification, and building closures and need alternate housing; and
8. Hundreds of SRO units have been lost to low income people in the last two years through closures and rent hikes.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT Council direct staff to find sites for 600 more modular housing units for people who are homeless **and report back by January 2019.**
- B. THAT Council task the Mayor with working diligently with provincial officials to secure at least an additional 600 modular housing units in 2019.
- C. **THAT any new modular housing must make accommodations for family units and for Indigenous women's specific needs for safe housing as an absolute high priority.**
- D. **THAT women must be better represented in all modular housing buildings with specific needs for safety and women's leadership taken into account.**
- E. **THAT all levels of government must ensure that women are prioritized in placements into modular housing, and must require all operators of all modular housing to have an intersectional gender strategy in place that keeps women safe and housed.**

amended

On December 12, 2018, at 10:30 am, Councillor De Genova relinquished the Chair to participate in debate. Councillor Fry assumed the Chair.

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Swanson

THAT the words “staff should raise with BC Housing that” be inserted in C following the first “THAT”;

FURTHER THAT the words “and racialized groups” be inserted following the word “women” in D.

withdrawn

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor De Genova

THAT the words “Council task”, “with working diligently with provincial officials” and “secure” be deleted and the following phrase inserted prior to “for at least an additional 600 units of”:

“write a letter on behalf of Council to the Minister responsible for BC Housing to request funding”;

FURTHER THAT the word “modular” be deleted from B and the words “supportive housing including modular” be inserted; and

FURTHER THAT C be deleted and replaced with the following:

THAT staff consider a gendered and intersectional lens and supportive housing opportunities, when bringing forward any future recommendations for supportive modular housing projects to Council, including modular; recognizing that BC Housing usually identify the non-profit providers and provide the operating funds;

FURTHER THAT that the scope of this lens includes all marginalized people including residents experiencing homelessness, women, children, persons with disabilities, and more specifically Indigenous, racialized, stigmatized and marginalized women.

withdrawn

* * * * *

On December 12, 2018, the Committee recessed at 10:44 am and reconvened at 11:07 am.

* * * * *

Councillor De Genova requested to withdraw her amendment to the amendment. The Committee agreed.

Councillor Swanson requested to withdraw her amendment to the main motion. The Committee agreed.

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Swanson

THAT B be amended as follows:

- replace the word “task” with “direct”;
- delete the phrase “with working diligently with provincial officials”
- replace the word “secure” with “request”
- delete the word “modular” and insert the words “including modular” following the word “housing”;

FURTHER THAT C and D each be amended by inserting the phrase “staff should raise with BC Housing that” following the word “THAT”.

carried

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the word “supportive” be inserted before the word “housing” in B.

LOST (TIE VOTE)

(Councillors Boyle, Fry, Swanson, Wiebe and Mayor Stewart opposed)

(Councillor Dominato absent for the vote) (Vote No. 03602)

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Kirby-Yung

THAT the word “modular” be deleted from C.

WITHDRAWN

Councillor Kirby-Yung requested to withdraw her amendment to the amendment. The Committee agreed.

The amendments to the amendment having lost or been withdrawn, the amendment was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY with Councillor Dominato absent for the vote (Vote No. 03603).

The amendment having carried, the motion as amended was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY with Councillor Dominato absent for the vote (Vote No. 03604)

FINAL MOTION AS APPROVED

WHEREAS

1. 2181 homeless people were counted in Vancouver this year;
2. Homeless people have about half the life expectancy as housed people;
3. Being homeless causes suffering and poor health;
4. The city spends millions of dollars dealing with the impact of homelessness with shelters, outreach programs, street cleaning, etc.;

5. The BC government's Homes for BC plan promises an additional \$291 million in capital funding and \$216 million in operating funding for housing for homeless people over the 2018-2021 period;
6. Many people who get into modular homes feel they have won the lottery;
7. Hundreds of SRO residents face poor conditions, rent hikes, gentrification, and building closures and need alternate housing; and
8. Hundreds of SRO units have been lost to low income people in the last two years through closures and rent hikes.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT Council direct staff to find sites for 600 more modular housing units for people who are homeless and report back by January 2019.
- B. THAT Council direct the Mayor-write a letter on behalf of Council to the Minister responsible for BC Housing to request funding for at least an additional 600 units of housing including modular, in 2019.
- C. THAT staff should raise with BC Housing that any new modular housing must make accommodations for family units and for Indigenous women's specific needs for safe housing as an absolute high priority.
- D. THAT staff raise with BC Housing that women must be better represented in all modular housing buildings with specific needs for safety and women's leadership taken into account; and
- E. THAT all levels of government must ensure that women, specifically indigenous women, are prioritized in placements into modular housing, and must require all operators of all modular housing to have an intersectional gender strategy in place that keeps women safe and housed.

11. Call for the ABC Plan for an Accountable, Bold and Comprehensive Poverty Reduction Plan for British Columbia

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred the following Motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers. Due to time constraints, speakers were heard and the motion was considered on December 12, 2018.

The Committee heard from one speaker in support of the motion.

* * * * *

On December 12, 2018, at 11:55 am it was

MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT the length of the meeting be extended to deal with the business of the agenda.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY**
(Councillors Dominato, Wiebe, and Mayor Stewart absent for the vote)

* * * * *

The Committee agreed to deal with discussion and decision on the motion following the lunch recess, in order to receive information from staff.

* * * * *

VARY AGENDA

MOVED by Councillor Bligh

THAT item 13 on the agenda be dealt with as the last item of business.

**CARRIED AND
BY THE REQUIRED MAJORITY**
(Councillors Fry and Hardwick opposed)
(Councillors Dominato and Wiebe absent for the vote)

On December 12, 2018, the Committee recessed at 12:05 pm and reconvened at 1:04 pm.

* * * * *

Following the recess, the City Manager responded to questions, noting that Council's support of the motion would not commit the City to any particular position on issues in the plan.

MOVED by Councillor Swanson
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. The City of Vancouver's website states that: "Poverty is a barrier to prosperity, not an alternative to it";
2. Vancouver has the second highest gap in income between rich and poor of Canadian cities⁵, vast visible poverty in the Downtown Eastside, and more than 10% of the working-age population are people who are working poor⁶. Poverty disproportionately affects certain communities in Vancouver, often as the result of historical dispossession, systemic racism and inequality;

⁵ "Prosperity for all through a Healthy Communities Approach: Vancouver's Recommendations to the Federal Government's National Poverty Reduction Strategy, July 2017." p 3.

⁶ Source: statistics Canada, 2012. Cited in www.policyalternatives.ca/van-working-poverty

3. Median personal income in Vancouver is 8 per cent lower than for Canada overall, despite its escalating cost of living. 44% of people in Vancouver, more than 250,000 people, live in families with incomes less than the living wage;
4. Many impacts of poverty are experienced at the local level, and local residents pay for poverty in increased health care costs, higher crime, higher demand for community, social and charitable services, lack of school readiness, reduced school success, and lower economic productivity;
5. The poorest people in Vancouver are those on welfare or unable to get on welfare. There is an insufficient number of social housing and shelter-rate units to meet the growing need. Vancouver is seeing increasing numbers of homeless people, with a very low vacancy rate, and welfare rates that do not provide enough money to cover food and shelter. As a result, the city spends millions of dollars trying to help people who are homeless and mitigate against the worst impacts of the housing crisis on our most vulnerable residents;
6. A long overdue increase in income and disability assistance rates, targeted measures to address the number of women and child living in poverty, rent control (including vacancy control), and legislated targets and timelines, would help ensure that government money spent to reduce poverty would benefit those most marginalized;
7. A poverty reduction plan will save lives and money as it is a social and economic investment in our province;
8. The BC Poverty Reduction Coalition is a broad-based network of over 400 organizations including community and non-profit groups, faith groups, health organizations, indigenous organizations, businesses, labour organizations, and social policy groups; and
9. The Coalition has renewed its call for a strong poverty reduction plan for British Columbia by launching the ABC Plan, which outlines an accountable, bold and comprehensive poverty reduction plan to prevent and reduce poverty in British Columbia.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT Council support the BC Poverty Reduction Coalition's ABC Plan for an accountable, bold and comprehensive poverty reduction plan for British Columbia as set out on the BC Poverty Reduction Coalition website:
<https://www.abcplan.ca/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/Policy-Brief.pdf>.
- B. THAT Council advocate to the Provincial Government to develop and implement a provincial poverty reduction strategy that includes the measures within the Accountable, Bold and Comprehensive Poverty Reduction Plan for British Columbia before February 2019, with the commitment that Council will work with the Provincial Government in implementing this plan.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03605)
(Councillors Dominato and Wiebe absent for the vote)

12. A Proposed Alternative to Provincial Encroachment on the City of Vancouver's Municipal Tax Base (Continued – December 12, 2018)

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred the following Motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers. Due to time constraints, speakers were heard on December 5, 2018, and the decision was made on December 12, 2018.

The Committee heard from 10 speakers generally in support of the motion.

* * * * *

On December 5, 2018, at 9:55 pm it was

MOVED by Councillor Kirby-Yung

THAT the length of the meeting be extended to conclude hearing the remaining speakers on item 12.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(Councillor Swanson abstained from the vote)

*(*Section 145.1 of the Vancouver Charter states "Where a member present at a meeting abstains from voting, they are deemed to have voted in the affirmative".)*

Subsequently, it was

MOVED by Councillor Kirby-Yung

THAT the meeting be recessed and reconvene at 9:30 am on Wednesday, December 12, 2018.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(Councillor Swanson absent for the vote)

The Committee recessed at 10:48 pm on December 5, 2018.

* * * * *

On December 12, 2018, it was

MOVED by Councillor Bligh

THAT the Committee recommend to Council

1. Property taxes are the main source of tax revenue for the City of Vancouver and other British Columbia municipalities;
2. In addition to municipal property taxes, the City of Vancouver also collects school taxes on behalf of the Province and remits these revenues to the Province;
3. Starting in 2019, the Province of British Columbia plans to apply a controversial surcharge on the provincial school tax, the proceeds of which will flow to the Province's general tax revenues;
<https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/taxes/property-taxes/annual-property-tax/school-tax>

4. The Province's surcharge on school taxes will apply to most "high-valued residential properties in the province", specifically those assessed at \$3 million or more;
5. The Province's school tax surtax rate will be an additional 0.2 percent on the residential portion of properties assessed between \$3 million and \$4 million (i.e., an additional \$2,000 surtax), and 0.4 percent on the residential portion of properties assessed over \$4 million (i.e., an additional \$4,000 surtax per million of assessed value);
6. Unlike the provincial school tax, and municipal property taxes, the Province's new surtax is not based on an equitable mill rate – it is based on a straight percentage of assessed value and assumed wealth, and it sets a controversial precedent;
7. There is an inequitable collection of the tax from those municipalities that have a higher distribution of homes valued over \$3 million, including the City of Vancouver; and
8. The Province's surcharge on the provincial school tax represents an encroachment on the City of Vancouver's municipal tax base. Residents could perceive the increase on their property tax bill is a result of municipal financial mismanagement and thus could 'revolt' against City of Vancouver property tax increases.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

THAT the Mayor of Vancouver on behalf of City Council send a letter to the Premier, BC Minister of Finance, Leader of the Opposition and Leader of the BC Green Party requesting that the Province withdraw the proposed surcharge on the provincial school tax and recommend that the Province use other tax-generating options available to the Province, such as the progressive income tax system, to fund the BC budget;

FURTHER THAT it be noted in the letter to the BC Minister of Finance that the Province's progressive income tax base could more equitably generate the \$250 million in revenue that the surtax is expected to raise toward the provincial budget – e.g., a 0.25-per-cent increase applied to the top income tax bracket would mean that a taxpayer with a net income of less than \$150,000 per year would pay no additional income tax while someone earning a net income of \$250,000 per year would only pay \$250 in additional income tax.

amended

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Fry

THAT the phrase "and recommend that the Province use other tax generating options available to the Province, such as the progressive income tax system, to fund the BC budget; and" be deleted from the first part of the resolution;

FURTHER THAT the second part of the resolution be deleted.

carried

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Swanson

THAT the phrase “unless the revenue from it comes to the City to use for affordable housing” be added following the words “school tax” in the first part of the resolution.

LOST (Vote No. 03606)

(Councillors Boyle, Bligh, Carr, De Genova, Fry, Hardwick, and Kirby-Yung opposed)

(Councillors Dominato and Wiebe absent for the vote)

The amendment to the amendment having lost, the amendment was put and CARRIED with Councillor Swanson opposed and Councillor Dominato absent for the vote (Vote No. 03607).

The amendment having carried, the motion as amended was put and CARRIED with Councillors Boyle, Swanson, and Mayor Stewart opposed, and Councillor Dominato absent for the vote (Vote No. 03608)

FINAL MOTION AS AMENDED

1. Property taxes are the main source of tax revenue for the City of Vancouver and other British Columbia municipalities;
2. In addition to municipal property taxes, the City of Vancouver also collects school taxes on behalf of the Province and remits these revenues to the Province;
3. Starting in 2019, the Province of British Columbia plans to apply a controversial surcharge on the provincial school tax, the proceeds of which will flow to the Province’s general tax revenues;
<https://www2.gov.bc.ca/gov/content/taxes/property-taxes/annual-property-tax/school-tax>
4. The Province’s surcharge on school taxes will apply to most “high-valued residential properties in the province”, specifically those assessed at \$3 million or more;
5. The Province’s school tax surtax rate will be an additional 0.2 percent on the residential portion of properties assessed between \$3 million and \$4 million (i.e., an additional \$2,000 surtax), and 0.4 percent on the residential portion of properties assessed over \$4 million (i.e., an additional \$4,000 surtax per million of assessed value);
6. Unlike the provincial school tax, and municipal property taxes, the Province’s new surtax is not based on an equitable mill rate – it is based on a straight percentage of assessed value and assumed wealth, and it sets a controversial precedent;
7. There is an inequitable collection of the tax from those municipalities that have a higher distribution of homes valued over \$3 million, including the City of Vancouver; and
8. The Province’s surcharge on the provincial school tax represents an encroachment on the City of Vancouver’s municipal tax base. Residents could perceive the increase on their property tax bill is a result of municipal financial mismanagement and thus could ‘revolt’ against City of Vancouver property tax increases.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

THAT the Mayor of Vancouver on behalf of City Council send a letter to the Premier, BC Minister of Finance, Leader of the Opposition and Leader of the BC Green Party requesting that the Province withdraw the proposed surcharge on the provincial school tax as an incursion onto an established municipal land tax base.

Note: earlier in the meeting, the Committee agreed to deal with item 14 as the next item of business. For ease of reference, the minutes are recorded in numerical order.

13. Mayor's Office Budget Review

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred the following Motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers. Due to time constraints, this matter was considered on December 12, 2018.

The registered speaker was not present.

* * * * *

On December 12, 2018, the Committee recessed at 3:19 pm and reconvened at 3:27 pm.

* * * * *

MOVED by Councillor Dominato
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. The City of Vancouver 2018 Operating Budget allocated \$3.050 million to the direct operational costs of the Mayor and Council, with 43 percent (i.e., \$1.312 million) of that amount allocated to the Mayor and the remaining 57 percent (i.e., \$1.738) million allocated to the activities of the 10 other members of Council;
2. The City of Vancouver's 2016 Statement of Financial Information indicates that the Mayor's Office discretionary expenses for 2016 totalled \$783,090 while the discretionary expenses for all City Councillors totalled \$14,517 – collectively less than 2 percent of the Mayor's expenditures;
3. The City of Vancouver's 2017 Statement of Financial Information indicates that the Mayor's Office discretionary expenses for 2017 totalled \$706,165 while the discretionary expenses for all City Councillors totalled \$20,880 – collectively less than 3 percent of the Mayor's expenditures;
4. During the previous Council term from 2014 to 2018, the Mayor's office budget and discretionary expense fund were the subject of considerable scrutiny, notably substantial expenditures on political staff and consultants;

5. In April 2016, Council enacted By-law 11483 (Mayor and Council Remuneration By-law) and By-law 11620 (minor amendment to 11483) to replace By-law 7465 and provide for updated base salaries for Deputy Mayor, Acting Mayor and Councillors, as well as to provide for annual adjustments to Mayor and Councillors' salaries based on the change in the Consumer Price Index for Vancouver (all items) for the 12 months ending October the previous year;
6. In June 2016, By-law 11529 (Mayor and Council Expense By-law) was enacted to replace By-law 8904 and established the annual discretionary fund for each Councillor to cover eligible expenses incurred while carrying out constituency activities;
7. By-law 11529 (Mayor and Council Expense By-law) included housekeeping amendments to provide clarifications for various eligible expenses, including the Mayor's discretionary fund which includes expenses incurred by the Mayor or his staff for meetings and conferences, travel, communications, consulting/contracting services, research/information gathering, and community outreach;
8. Prior to the enactment of By-laws 11483 and 11529, the City of Vancouver 2015 Operating Budget included a substantial 23.6% increase to the Mayor's budget – a \$0.2 million increase to support the Mayor's role as Chair of TransLink Mayors' Council, the Big City Mayors' Caucus, Vancouver Police Board, and Vancouver Economic Commission; <https://vancouver.ca/files/cov/vancouver-2015-budget.pdf>;
9. The recent municipal elections in Metro Vancouver have resulted in changes to the makeup of the TransLink Mayors' Council and will potentially lead to changed roles on other bodies such as the Big City Mayors' Caucus; and
10. Newly-elected Vancouver Mayor Kennedy Stewart has demonstrated his commitment to a different approach to governing, for example, restoring the traditional rotation of the Deputy Mayor duties, as well as appointing Councillors to various boards and committees on a non-partisan basis.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT Vancouver City Council direct the 2019 Budget Committee to review the Mayor's Office and Council budgets in the context of current fiscal requirements and the new spirit of equity exhibited by Mayor Stewart, prior to the Special Council meeting on the 2019 budget scheduled for December 11, 2018.
- B. THAT the Chair of the 2019 Budget Committee provide a memo to Council on behalf of the Committee with any recommendations regarding savings and efficiencies that could be achieved within these budgets (to be incorporated into the 2019 Draft Operating Budget), as well as any appropriate options to re-allocate portions of the Mayor's Office budget to support the duties and constituency activities of City Councillors.

amended

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Boyle

THAT the words “prior to the Special Council meeting on the 2019 budget scheduled for December 11, 2018” be deleted from A;

FURTHER THAT B be amended as follows

- Delete the words “Chair of the”
- Delete the phrase “provide a memo to Council on behalf of the Committee with any recommendations regarding”
- Insert the words “review any” before the word “savings”
- Insert the words “going forwards” following the words “these budgets”
- Delete the phrase “within these budgets (to be incorporated into the 2019 Draft Operating Budget), as well as any appropriate options to re-allocate portions of the Mayor’s Office Budget” and insert “as well as consider any re-allocations” in its place;
- Insert the words “Mayor and” before “City Councillors”

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03613)
(Mayor Stewart abstained from the vote)

*(*Section 145.1 of the Vancouver Charter states “Where a member present at a meeting abstains from voting, they are deemed to have voted in the affirmative”.)*

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Dominato

THAT the words “and any future Budget Committees” be inserted following “2019 Budget Committee” in B.

CARRIED (Vote No. 03615)
(Councillor Wiebe opposed)
(Mayor Stewart abstained from the vote)

The amendments having carried, the motion as amended was put and CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY with Mayor Stewart abstaining from the vote (Vote No. 03616)

*(*Section 145.1 of the Vancouver Charter states “Where a member present at a meeting abstains from voting, they are deemed to have voted in the affirmative”.)*

FINAL MOTION AS AMENDED

WHEREAS

1. The City of Vancouver 2018 Operating Budget allocated \$3.050 million to the direct operational costs of the Mayor and Council, with 43 percent (i.e., \$1.312 million) of that amount allocated to the Mayor and the remaining 57 percent (i.e., \$1.738) million allocated to the activities of the 10 other members of Council;
2. The City of Vancouver’s 2016 Statement of Financial Information indicates that the Mayor’s Office discretionary expenses for 2016 totalled \$783,090 while the discretionary expenses for all City Councillors totalled \$14,517 – collectively less than 2 percent of the Mayor’s expenditures;

3. The City of Vancouver's 2017 Statement of Financial Information indicates that the Mayor's Office discretionary expenses for 2017 totalled \$706,165 while the discretionary expenses for all City Councillors totalled \$20,880 – collectively less than 3 percent of the Mayor's expenditures;
4. During the previous Council term from 2014 to 2018, the Mayor's office budget and discretionary expense fund were the subject of considerable scrutiny, notably substantial expenditures on political staff and consultants;
5. In April 2016, Council enacted By-law 11483 (Mayor and Council Remuneration By-law) and By-law 11620 (minor amendment to 11483) to replace By-law 7465 and provide for updated base salaries for Deputy Mayor, Acting Mayor and Councillors, as well as to provide for annual adjustments to Mayor and Councillors' salaries based on the change in the Consumer Price Index for Vancouver (all items) for the 12 months ending October the previous year;
6. In June 2016, By-law 11529 (Mayor and Council Expense By-law) was enacted to replace By-law 8904 and established the annual discretionary fund for each Councillor to cover eligible expenses incurred while carrying out constituency activities;
7. By-law 11529 (Mayor and Council Expense By-law) included housekeeping amendments to provide clarifications for various eligible expenses, including the Mayor's discretionary fund which includes expenses incurred by the Mayor or his staff for meetings and conferences, travel, communications, consulting/contracting services, research/information gathering, and community outreach;
8. Prior to the enactment of By-laws 11483 and 11529, the City of Vancouver 2015 Operating Budget included a substantial 23.6% increase to the Mayor's budget – a \$0.2 million increase to support the Mayor's role as Chair of TransLink Mayors' Council, the Big City Mayors' Caucus, Vancouver Police Board, and Vancouver Economic Commission; <https://vancouver.ca/files/cov/vancouver-2015-budget.pdf>;
9. The recent municipal elections in Metro Vancouver have resulted in changes to the makeup of the TransLink Mayors' Council and will potentially lead to changed roles on other bodies such as the Big City Mayors' Caucus; and
10. Newly-elected Vancouver Mayor Kennedy Stewart has demonstrated his commitment to a different approach to governing, for example, restoring the traditional rotation of the Deputy Mayor duties, as well as appointing Councillors to various boards and committees on a non-partisan basis.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT Vancouver City Council direct the 2019 Budget Committee to review the Mayor's Office and Council budgets in the context of current fiscal requirements and the new spirit of equity exhibited by Mayor Stewart.
- B. THAT the 2019 Budget Committee and any future Budget Committees review any savings and efficiencies that could be achieved within these budgets going forward, as well as consider any re-allocations to support the duties and constituency activities of the Mayor and City Councillors.

14. Creating a 'Baseline Review' Task Force

At the Regular Council meeting on December 4, 2018, Vancouver City Council referred the following Motion to the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting on December 5, 2018, in order to hear from speakers. Due to time constraints, this item was considered on December 12, 2018.

The Committee heard from two speakers in support of the motion.

MOVED by Councillor Hardwick
THAT the Committee recommend to Council

WHEREAS

1. With any newly elected government body, there is a responsibility to understand what the baseline finances are in detail;
2. It has been ten (10) years since the City undertook a comprehensive financial review;
3. The City's operating budget has doubled since 2008 and the new Council has a duty to understand year over year where the areas of expenditures have increased;
4. A review will give the new Council a baseline of knowledge so any financial decisions made going forward can be informed ones;
5. A review will provide Council an understanding of what the current and projected financial capacity is of the City and what contingencies, risks, and assumptions have been considered in that determination; and
6. A review will also help Council identify potential opportunities for efficiencies.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, to ensure the new Council is meeting the responsibilities of building a great city in keeping with its mandate under the *Vancouver Charter* and demonstrating transparency and fiscal responsibility from the start:

- A. THAT Council appoint a three (3) member, independent Oversight Commission to undertake a baseline review of all city finances.
- B. THAT Council direct staff to report back to Council by December 18, 2018 with draft Terms of Reference, schedule and details of the review for the Independent Oversight Commission for Council to approve, including a recommended budget for the Commission's work, with an expectation that the Commission reports back to Council by end of February 2019 to help inform current and future financial issues including the 2020 budget planning process. The intent is for an expeditious review process of about six (6) weeks.

amended

REFERRAL MOVED by Councillor Fry

THAT the motion "Creating a 'Baseline Review' Task Force" be referred to the 2019 Budget Committee for review.

withdrawn

* * * * *

MOVED by Councillor Hardwick

THAT the Committee take a brief recess.

*CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Councillor Dominato absent for the vote)*

On December 12, 2018, the Committee recessed at 2:30 pm and reconvened at 2:43 pm.

* * * * *

Councillor Fry requested to withdraw his motion to refer. The Committee agreed.

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Carr

THAT A and B be replaced with the following:

THAT Council direct staff to report back to Council by the end of February 2019 with draft Terms of Reference for an Independent Oversight Committee to undertake a baseline review of City finances, and a recommended budget and timeline for the Committee's work, with an expectation that the Committee report back to Council by the end of Q2 2019 to help inform the 2020 budget planning process.

amended

AMENDMENT TO THE AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Fry

THAT the phrase "by the end of Q2 2019" be deleted from the motion.

CARRIED (Vote No. 03609)
(Councillors De Genova and Hardwick opposed)

The amendment to the amendment having carried, the amendment as amended was put and CARRIED with Mayor Stewart opposed (Vote No. 03610)

The amendment having carried, the motion as amended was put and CARRIED with Councillors Boyle, Fry and Swanson opposed (Vote No. 03611)

Following advice from the Deputy City Clerk regarding amending the preamble of a members' motion, it was

MOVED by Councillor Fry

THAT parts 2 and 3 of the preamble to the motion be deleted.

CARRIED (Vote No. 03612)
(Councillors Dominato and Kirby-Yung opposed)

FINAL MOTION AS APPROVED

WHEREAS

1. With any newly elected government body, there is a responsibility to understand what the baseline finances are in detail;
2. A review will give the new Council a baseline of knowledge so any financial decisions made going forward can be informed ones;
3. A review will provide Council an understanding of what the current and projected financial capacity is of the City and what contingencies, risks, and assumptions have been considered in that determination;
4. A review will also help Council identify potential opportunities for efficiencies.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT , to ensure the new Council is meeting the responsibilities of building a great city in keeping with its mandate under the Vancouver Charter and demonstrating transparency and fiscal responsibility from the start Council direct staff to report back to Council by the end of February 2019 with draft Terms of Reference for an Independent Oversight Committee to undertake a baseline review of City finances, and a recommended budget and timeline for the Committee's work, with an expectation that the Committee report back to Council by the end of Q2 2019 to help inform the 2020 budget planning process.

The Committee
adjourned at 3:49 pm on December 12, 2018.

* * * * *



**REGULAR COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
STANDING COMMITTEE OF COUNCIL ON
CITY FINANCE AND SERVICES**

DECEMBER 5, 2018

A Regular Meeting of the Council of the City of Vancouver was held on Wednesday, December 5, 2018, at 10:48 pm, in the Council Chamber, Third Floor, City Hall, following the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services meeting, to consider the recommendations and actions of the Committee. Subsequently, the meeting reconvened at 3:49 pm on December 12, 2018.

PRESENT:

- Mayor Kennedy Stewart
- Councillor Rebecca Bligh
- Councillor Christine Boyle
- Councillor Adriane Carr
- Councillor Melissa De Genova
- Councillor Lisa Dominato
- Councillor Pete Fry
- Councillor Colleen Hardwick
- Councillor Sarah Kirby-Yung
- Councillor Jean Swanson*
- Councillor Michael Wiebe

CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE: Sadhu Johnston, City Manager

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Rosemary Hagiwara, Deputy City Clerk
Nicole Ludwig, Meeting Coordinator

COMMITTEE REPORTS

Report of Standing Committee on City Finance and Services
Wednesday, December 5, 2018

Council considered the report containing the recommendations and actions taken by the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services. Its items of business included:

1. 2018 Climate Change Adaptation Strategy Update
2. Water Use in Buildings: Enhanced Public Safety, Efficiency and Long-Term Resiliency Measures
3. Temporary Modular Housing Homelessness Action Week Grants
4. 2019 Land Assessment Averaging: Notice to BC Assessment Authority
5. Conflict of Interest Rules
6. Lobbyist Registry for the City of Vancouver
7. Possible Amendments to By-law 6066 to Allow for Safe and Licensed Ride Sharing in Vancouver
8. Building a Family Friendly Vancouver: Affordable Child Care

Items 1 to 8

MOVED by Councillor De Genova
SECONDED by Councillor Carr

THAT the recommendations and actions taken by the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services at its meeting of December 5, 2018, as contained in items 1 to 8, be approved.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Councillor Swanson absent for the vote)

URGENT BUSINESS

1. Request for Leave of Absence – Mayor Stewart

MOVED by Councillor Carr
SECONDED by Councillor De Genova

THAT Mayor Stewart be granted Leave of Absence for Civic Business for any meetings to be held December 13, 2018.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY (Vote No. 03595)
(Councillor Swanson absent for the vote)

* * * * *

On December 5, Council recessed at 10:50 pm and reconvened on December 12, 2018 at 3:49 pm.

* * * * *

**Report of Standing Committee on City Finance and Services
Wednesday, December 12, 2018**

Council considered the report containing the recommendations and actions taken by the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services, which started on December 5, 2018, at its reconvened meeting on December 12, 2018. Its items of business included:

9. Land Value Capture in the City of Vancouver
10. Motion Calling for 600 More Units of Modular Housing in 2019
11. Call for the ABC Plan for an Accountable, Bold and Comprehensive Poverty Reduction Plan for British Columbia
12. A Proposed Alternative to Provincial Encroachment on the City of Vancouver's Municipal Tax Base
13. Mayor's Office Budget Review
14. Creating a "Baseline Review" Task Force

MOVED by Councillor Dominato

SECONDED by Councillor Carr

THAT the recommendations and actions taken by the Standing Committee on City Finance and Services at its meeting of December 12, 2018, as contained in items 9 to 14, be approved.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Councillor Carr
SECONDED by Councillor De Genova

THAT the meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Council adjourned on December 12, 2018, at 3:50 pm.

* * * * *