



Vancouver Police Department

Operational Review

Phase 1 Update Report

Adam Palmer, Sergeant 1393
Vancouver Police Department

Curt Taylor Griffiths, Ph.D.
Senior Project Consultant
Simon Fraser University

With the assistance of:

Simon Demers, Planning Analyst
Hollie Riordan, Planning Analyst
Brian Polydore, Planning Advisor
Phil Heard, Constable 2053

February 5, 2007

Table of Contents

Background.....	4
The 19 Positions Recommended for Civilianization.....	8
• 31 New Sworn Positions Created Due to Council Approval.....	9
• Status of the 19 Civilianized Positions.....	10
• 19 New Sworn Positions Created Due to Civilianization.....	12
The Seven Outstanding Positions for Civilianization Review.....	12
1. Constable, Business Liaison Officer.....	13
2. Constable, Block Watch.....	14
3. Constable, Forensic Identification Unit.....	16
4. Sergeant, Labour Relations.....	17
5. Sergeant, Attendance Management.....	18
6. Sergeant, Career Development Unit.....	19
7. Inspector, Human Resources.....	20
Other Recommendations from Phase 1.....	21
• Shared Services – False Alarm Reduction Program (FARP).....	26
• Shared Services – Payroll.....	26

Background

In September 2003, the Vancouver Police Department (VPD) embarked on a strategic planning exercise followed by a study to identify the Department's overall staffing requirements. The result was the creation of the VPD Strategic Plan 2004 – 2008. In October 2004, the VPD completed the long-range Staffing Report. This report presented a request for an increase of 469 officers and 170 civilian staff over and above existing authorized levels of 1,124 and 231.5 respectively over a five year period.

The City and the Vancouver Police Board agreed to create a Steering Committee who hired a team of consultants from the University College of the Fraser Valley (UCFV) to conduct an independent staffing review. They identified, along with an immediate need for an increase of 92 sworn officers and 55 civilians, that, in some cases, there was insufficient linkage between the VPD's Strategic Plan and the staffing requests. Moreover, information such as operational plans, workload statistics, benchmarks and performance targets were not available. Specifically, the consultants identified a serious shortage of analytical and planning staff in the Planning & Research Section (P&R).

The consultants identified short-term and medium-term planning that needed to occur, including:

- operational planning for major service areas
- patrol staffing, deployment, scheduling and performance studies
- organizational review
- overtime utilization
- civilianization
- business plans for all units

The joint Steering Committee supported the recommendations of the independent consultant to increase staffing by 92 sworn officers and 54 civilian staff, however, these increases were to be phased in over two years.

In establishing the 2005 Operating Budget, Council approved an increase of 50 police officers and 27 civilian staff for 2005 and an additional 50 police officers and 27 civilian staff for 2006. The increase in staffing for 2006 was subject to the approval of a strategic operating plan, and a report back by the Steering Committee on projected overtime savings and shared services opportunities as outlined below.

Council Meeting Following Standing Committee on City Services and Budgets Meeting March 17, 2005 Decisions:

- a) THAT Council establish, in 2005 a total of 50 sworn officers, and 27 civilian positions, including associated one-time and vehicle rental costs, to be funded by increasing property taxes and that staff report back on March 31, 2005 on the financial impact and the recommendation accordingly; and,*

THAT Council establish 50 additional sworn police positions and 27 additional full-time civilian positions in 2006, including associated one-time and vehicle rental costs, subject to approval of a strategic operating plan and the report from the Steering Committee as specified in T (b); and,

All civilian positions will be subject to General Manager of Human Resources classification review, and are to be specified in the March 31, 2005 report back.

All vehicles are to be purchased by the Plant and Equipment Reserve (Plant Account) in accordance to the VPD Master Schedule.

b) THAT Council direct the Steering Committee to report back in late 2005 on projected overtime savings, shared services opportunities and other potential efficiencies relative to the 2006 staffing request, and;

c) THAT Council direct the Steering Committee to continue to implement the recommendations of the independent consultants, as outlined on pages xx through xxii of the Executive Summary of the Review of the Vancouver Police Department's Staffing Requirements; and approve a temporary full-time position to report directly to Corporate Services Group for a two-year term to oversee the implementation process at a cost of \$85,000 per year.

In August 2005, the joint VPD and City Steering Committee approved a project plan that would achieve the deliverables outlined in the above recommendations over a two year period. The project deliverables were divided into two phases. The first phase of the VPD Operational Review was completed and reported back to Council in March 2006. The report on Phase 2 will be reported to Council in 2007.

Phase 1 (August 2005 – March 2006) included:

- Completion of a Strategic Operational Plan
- Completion of a Civilianization Study and a shared services review
- Completion of an Overtime Review

Phase 2 (April 2006 – June 2007) includes:

- Completion of a Patrol Deployment Study
- Completion of mini-business plans for non-patrol units
- Further overtime review
- Development of an Operational Plan

The Civilianization Study assessed all of the sworn and civilian positions in the VPD to determine whether the positions were most appropriately classified as sworn or civilian. The assessment was performed via interviews with sworn and civilian managers about the positions under their span of control and by an independent analysis of sworn and civilian positions.

Based on a review of the best practice policing literature, a decision making tree was developed, composed of three questions that were asked of every position in the Department (with the exception of patrol and clerical support):

1. Does the position require law enforcement powers? (i.e. powers of arrest, use of force, statutory requirement, carrying a firearm)
2. Are the skills, training, experience, or credibility of a sworn police officer required to fulfill the duties of the position?
3. Can the requirements of the position be fulfilled by a specially-trained civilian?

As well, interviewees were given the opportunity to provide comments to elaborate on these three questions.

Based on the two assessments of sworn positions in the VPD, the project team recommended that 19 sworn officer positions (working in 11 different types of positions) be reclassified as civilian positions.

The recommended positions and the suggested conversion timeline were as follows (subject to transitional Human Resource accommodation considerations):

Position	Timeline
Inspector, Planning and Research (1)	December 31, 2006
Inspector, Quality Assurance (1)	July 1, 2006
Corporal (WSE), Health & Safety Coordinator (1)	July 1, 2006
Constable, ViCLAS (1)	July 1, 2006
Constable, Document Services (3)	September 1, 2006 (x3)
Constable, Youth Referral Coordinator (1)	July 1, 2006
Constable, Information & Privacy (1)	July 1, 2006
Constable, Crime Analysis Unit (4)	July 1, 2006 (x2)
	December 31, 2006 (x2)
Constable, District Analyst (4)	July 1, 2006 (x2)
	December 31, 2006 (x2)
Constable, Robbery/Assault Analyst (1)	July 1, 2006
Constable, Statement Analysis (1)	July 1, 2006

As a result of the review, there were some positions that required further investigation to determine whether they should remain sworn or potentially convert to civilian positions. The following positions were reviewed in Phase 2 upon completion of each of their respective business plans.

1. Constable, Business Liaison Officer
2. Constable, Block Watch
3. Constable, Forensic Identification Unit
4. Sergeant, Labour Relations
5. Sergeant, Attendance Management
6. Sergeant, Career Development Unit
7. Inspector, Human Resources

Upon completing Phase 1 of the Operational Review the project team also recommended that the VPD:

- Human Resources Section create a system to ensure periodic, regular reviews of all position profiles to ensure they are current;
- explore relocating the Crime Analysis Unit from the Patrol Support Section to the Planning and Research Section;
- relocate the Quality Assurance Section to the Planning and Research Section and that the Planning and Research Section be re-named the Planning, Research and Audit Section;
- adopt the International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) Model Policy on Civilianization;
- create a written policy on civilianization that includes the three questions comprising the decision making tree in the Civilianization Study;
- develop a tenure policy for secondments. It should be noted that the Human Resources Section of the VPD was developing a tenure policy for secondments while the Civilianization Study was in progress;
- consolidate all of its current policies on accommodation into one formal policy, such policy to be guided by best practices in other police departments and municipalities;
- develop a written policy on developmental positions which includes the objectives of developmental positions and potential areas of placement throughout the Department;
- transfer the positions of False Alarm Reduction Coordinator and the four clerk typists to the City of Vancouver and a transition plan be prepared to effect this change by the end of 2006;

- and the City of Vancouver create a working group comprised of VPD and City of Vancouver Payroll professionals to explore implementing shared services in the area of Payroll.

The working group will:

- report to the Steering Committee;
 - be co-chaired by the VPD and City of Vancouver managers who are responsible for Payroll;
 - be established no later than April 30th, 2006;
 - conduct all analysis necessary, including costs and benefits, to determine if there is a reasonable business case for structuring COV/VPD Payroll as a shared service;
 - present any disagreements to the Steering Committee;
 - develop an implementation plan if the Steering Committee approves proceeding with Payroll as a shared service; and,
 - report back the final results to the Steering Committee by September 30th, 2006.
- continue to support the 311 Call Centre initiative and the opportunity for shared services with the switchboard telephone operators; and,
 - follow the implementation timeline recommended in this report (Table 13) to reclassify the identified positions from sworn to civilian (subject to transitional HR accommodation considerations).

This report will provide an update on the recommendations from Phase 1 of the Operational Review.

The 19 Positions Recommended for Civilianization

On April 6th 2006, Vancouver City Council approved 31 new sworn officers for the VPD. An additional 19 sworn officer positions were identified for civilianization which, in effect, allowed the Department to create 50 new sworn positions for 2006. The 50 positions were identified for Council on March 21, 2006 (RTS No.: 5019) and closely followed the recommendations identified in the 2005 UCFV staffing review.

The 31 new sworn positions that were approved in 2006 are as follows:

2006 Approvals – 31 New Sworn Positions Created Due to Council Approval

1.	DCC Operations (Executive Officer)	Inspector
2.	District 2 (Beat Enforcement Team)	Constable
3.	District 2 (Beat Enforcement Team)	Constable
4.	District 2 (Beat Enforcement Team)	Constable
5.	District 2 (Beat Enforcement Team)	Constable
6.	District 2 (Beat Enforcement Team)	Constable
7.	Patrol Support Section (Identity Theft Task Force)	Sergeant
8.	Patrol Support Section (Identity Theft Task Force)	Constable
9.	Patrol Support Section (Identity Theft Task Force)	Constable
10.	Patrol Support Section (Identity Theft Task Force)	Constable
11.	Major Crime Section (Homicide Squad)	Constable
12.	Major Crime Section (Homicide Squad)	Constable
13.	Major Crime Section (Robbery/Assault Squad)	Constable
14.	Major Crime Section (Robbery/Assault Squad)	Constable
15.	Major Crime Section (Robbery/Assault Squad)	Constable
16.	Major Crime Section (Robbery/Assault Squad)	Constable
17.	Special Investigation Section (Domestic Violence and Criminal Harassment Unit)	Constable
18.	Special Investigation Section (Domestic Violence and Criminal Harassment Unit)	Constable
19.	Special Investigation Section (Domestic Violence and Criminal Harassment Unit)	Constable
20.	Forensic Services Section (Forensic Identification Unit)	Sergeant
21.	Forensic Services Section (Forensic Identification Unit)	Constable
22.	Forensic Services Section (Forensic Identification Unit)	Constable
23.	Forensic Services Section (Forensic Identification Unit)	Constable
24.	Youth Services Section (Gang Crime Unit)	Constable

2006 Approvals – 31 New Sworn Positions Created Due to Council Approval

25.	Youth Services Section (Gang Crime Unit)	Constable
26.	Youth Services Section (Gang Crime Unit)	Constable
27.	Criminal Intelligence Section (Counter Terrorism Unit)	Sergeant
28.	Criminal Intelligence Section (Counter Terrorism Unit)	Constable
29.	Criminal Intelligence Section (Counter Terrorism Unit)	Constable
30.	Property Office & Facility Planning Section	Inspector
31.	Training & Recruiting Section (Education & Training Unit – PRIME Trainer)	Constable

All of the 19 positions recommended for civilianization have either been filled or are in the process of being filled. The following table provides details on the 19 positions that were recommended for civilianization and the status of their transition from sworn to civilian member.

Status of the 19 Civilianized Positions

	Section	Sworn (before)	Civilian (after)	Status
1.	Planning & Research Section	Inspector	Director	Filled September 18, 2006
2.	Quality Assurance Section	Inspector	Manager - Audit	Posting closed December 22, 2006
3.	Human Resources Section (Safety & Health Coordination Unit)	Corporal (WSE)	Safety & Health Coordinator	Filled January 2, 2007
4.	Major Crime Section (Robbery/Assault Squad - Analyst)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Posting closed October 27, 2006 Interviews in progress
5.	Special Investigation Section (Statement Analysis)	Constable	Statement Analyst	Filled November 27, 2006
6.	Special Investigation Section (ViCLAS)	Constable	ViCLAS Coordinator	Filled January 1, 2007
7.	Court & Detention Services Section (Document Services Unit)	Constable	Special Constable (Document Server)	Will be posted in February 2007
8.	Court & Detention Services Section (Document Services Unit)	Constable	Special Constable (Document Server)	Will be posted in February 2007
9.	Court & Detention Services Section (Document Services Unit)	Constable	Special Constable (Document Server)	Will be posted in February 2007

10.	Youth Services Section (Youth Referral Coordinator)	Constable	Youth Referral Coordinator	Have selected person, awaiting security clearance
11.	Information Management Section (Information & Privacy Unit)	Constable	Information & Privacy Analyst	Posting closed December 21, 2006
12.	Patrol Support Section (Crime Analysis Unit)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Filled November 1, 2006
13.	Patrol Support Section (Crime Analysis Unit)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Filled November 1, 2006
14.	Patrol Support Section (Crime Analysis Unit)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Filled December 4, 2006
15.	Patrol Support Section (Crime Analysis Unit)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Filled January 2, 2007
16.	District 1 (Analyst)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Filled November 1, 2006
17.	District 2 (Analyst)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Filled November 1, 2006
18.	District 3 (Analyst)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Filled November 1, 2006
19.	District 4 (Analyst)	Constable	Serious Crime Analyst	Filled October 23, 2006

The officers who were in these positions have either moved on to other positions within the Department, are waiting for civilians to take over their position, or have retired. It should be noted that none of the 19 officers who were in the civilianized positions subsequently moved into the 19 newly created sworn positions. As the new sworn positions were created, they were posted Department-wide for applicants and filled by people from throughout the organization. The 19 officers who were displaced due to their position being civilianized were reassigned as follows:

- Operations Division – 9
- Operations Support Division – 2
- Investigation Division – 2
- Support Services Division – 3
- Secondment – 1
- Retired – 2

Several of these people were accommodated employees prior to the civilianization of their position and had to be re-accommodated to other positions throughout the Department.

The following table shows the 19 new sworn positions that were created as a result of the civilianization process (the positions that were civilianized were noted in the previous table):

2006 Approvals – 19 New Sworn Positions Created Due to Civilianization		
1.	Services Liaison Section (Station NCO)	Sergeant
2.	Services Liaison Section (Station NCO)	Sergeant
3.	Services Liaison Section (Station NCO)	Sergeant
4.	Services Liaison Section (Station NCO)	Sergeant
5.	Forensic Services Section (Financial Crime Squad)	Constable
6.	Forensic Services Section (Financial Crime Squad)	Constable
7.	Criminal Intelligence Section (Counter Terrorism Unit)	Constable
8.	Training & Recruiting Section (Force Options Training Unit)	Sergeant
9.	Special Investigation Section (Domestic Violence and Criminal Harassment Unit)	Constable
10.	Emergency Operations And Planning Section	Constable
11.	District 4 (Neighborhood Policing Officer)	Constable
12.	DCC Operations (Reader Sergeant)	Sergeant
13.	DCC Operations (Reader Sergeant)	Sergeant
14.	DCC Operations (Reader Sergeant)	Sergeant
15.	DCC Operations (Reader Sergeant)	Sergeant
16.	Patrol Support Section (Fugitive Squad)	Sergeant
17.	Patrol Support Section (Fugitive Squad)	Constable
18.	Patrol Support Section (Fugitive Squad)	Constable
19.	Patrol Support Section (Fugitive Squad)	Constable

The Seven Outstanding Positions for Civilianization Review

As part of the Vancouver Police Department's Operational Review, a Civilianization Study was completed in March of 2006. The study assessed every sworn and civilian position in the VPD to determine whether the position was most appropriately classified as sworn or civilian. Each position was assessed using a decision making grid that was comprised of three questions:

1. Does the position require law enforcement powers? (i.e. powers of arrest, use of force, statutory requirement, carrying a firearm)
2. Are the skills, training, experience, or credibility of a sworn police officer required to fulfill the duties of the position?
3. Can the requirements of the position be fulfilled by a specialty-trained civilian?

The assessment of each position was performed by both an interview-based team that discussed with sworn and civilian managers the positions under their span of control and by an independent assessment of sworn and civilian positions provided by the VPD Human Resources Section. In addition, Mike Zora, the General Manager of Human Resources for the City of Vancouver, assessed all of the sworn positions in the VPD's Human Resources Section.

The civilianization study recommended that 11 positions could be converted from sworn to civilian. In addition to these 11 positions, the study recommended that the following seven positions be examined further, as the viability of civilianizing these positions was unclear at the end of the study:

1. Constable, Business Liaison Officer
2. Constable, Block Watch
3. Constable, Forensic Identification Unit
4. Sergeant, Labour Relations
5. Sergeant, Attendance Management
6. Sergeant, Career Development Unit
7. Inspector, Human Resources

The following analysis of each position is segmented into a summary of the findings made in the Civilianization Study, a discussion of the key issues that facilitate or prevent the civilianization of the position, and a recommendation to decision makers on how each position should be classified. It should be noted that this document is meant to provide the reader with a concise and accurate overview of the critical issues and concerns that impact each position.

Position: Constable, Business Liaison Officer

Findings of the Civilianization Study

The conclusion of the Civilianization Study was based on a discrepancy found during the analysis. The independent assessor recommended that this position be reclassified as civilian, while the interview-based assessment team concluded that a sworn member is required for this position. The Civilianization Study concluded that this position should be reviewed once a Strategic Business Plan for this unit is created.

Discussion

The Business Liaison Constable oversees the Shoplifter Release Program. This program is beneficial in that it reduces the time patrol officers spend processing shoplifting reports. As a result of this position, the VPD achieves a more efficient use of the patrol resources that are currently deployed. Frontline patrol officers are able to forward these reports to the Business Liaison Constable for review and conclusion of the file. The Business Liaison Constable concludes the investigation, does any follow-up work that may be required, and ensures that the file exceeds VPD's quality standards before being forwarded on to Crown Counsel. Under the Shoplifter Release Program, the Business Liaison Constable is also responsible for training Loss Prevention Officers (LPOs), which are employed by private firms, on their powers of arrest under the Criminal Code of Canada, investigative methods that can be used in shoplifting investigations, and the evidentiary requirements needed to support a criminal charge of theft.

The Business Liaison Constable also oversees the Operation Cooperation Program, which facilitates communication and information exchange between the VPD and private security staff. This program gives the VPD access to information that is collected by private security personnel, which is a cost effective means of increasing the information capturing ability of the VPD. Under this program, the VPD educates and informs private security on issues that may affect them. For instance, the Business Liaison Constable trains and advises security personnel on their ability to take action under both the Criminal Code and the Safe Streets Act.

Recommendation

The activities that are currently performed by this position require the skills, training, and experience of a sworn police officer. Therefore, the Business Liaison Officer position should remain classified as a sworn position at this time. However, the on-going Operational Review will soon begin examining the VPD's community policing strategy and the resources deployed in this regard. As this position is part of the Community Policing Services Unit, it is entirely possible that the roles and/or duties of this section could change as a result of this review. For this reason, it is recommended that the final decision regarding whether this position could be civilianized be deferred until this study of the VPD's community policing activities is concluded.

Position: Constable, Block Watch Coordinator

Findings of the Civilianization Study

Similar to the Business Liaison Position, the Civilianization Study concluded that there was a discrepancy regarding this position. The independent assessor recommended that this position be reclassified as civilian, while the interview-based assessment team concluded that a sworn member is required for this position. As a result of this

discrepancy, the Civilianization Study recommended that this position be reviewed once a Strategic Business Plan for this unit is created.

Discussion

The Block Watch coordinator is responsible for overseeing the Block Watch Program. This involves screening, training, and liaising with the community members that participate in this program. In addition, the Block Watch coordinator has to investigate and follow-up on crimes and suspicious activities that are observed by program participants. This program is beneficial to the VPD in that it facilitates increased community participation in crime reduction. It is essential to the program that participants are sufficiently trained to identify criminal and suspicious behaviour. It is advantageous to have a sworn officer fulfill these duties as they are trained and experienced in investigating criminal activity. Also, the investigation of such activities may require the legal authority of a sworn officer. As such, civilianizing this position would be a detriment to the effectiveness of the Block Watch Program.

In addition to these activities, the Block Watch coordinator is responsible for designing and implementing strategies that resolve neighborhood specific problems. Creating such crime reduction strategies requires an individual that can simultaneously consider the needs of the community, identify the underlying reasons for the problem, recognize policing strategies that have been proven to be effective at combating similar situations, and determine the appropriate police and community resources that need to be mobilized. While a civilian may be able to perform some of these functions, they are unlikely to be fluent in past and current police tactics that are used to resolve community issues. Unfortunately, this may result in an inability to determine the correct level of police resources that need to be allocated to the problem. Such resource allocation considerations are critical as over responding to a problem is inefficient, while failing to respond adequately to the problem will not resolve the situation, this will result in a need for further police response, and is therefore an inefficient use of public resources.

Recommendation

The Civilianization Study determined that the activities currently performed by this position are best suited to an individual that has the skills, training, and experience of a sworn police officer. Therefore, at this time it is recommended that the Block Watch coordinator remain classified as a sworn position. As with the Business Liaison Officer, the on-going Operational Review will soon begin examining the VPD's community policing strategy and the resources deployed in this regard. Similar to the Business Liaison Officer, this position is part of the Community Policing Services Unit. As a result of the Operational Review, it is possible that the roles and/or duties of this unit could change in the future. Thus, it is recommended that the final decision regarding whether this position could be civilianized be deferred until the VPD's community policing activities are examined.

Position: Constable, Forensic Identification Unit

Findings of the Civilianization Study

The Civilianization Study concluded that there was a discrepancy regarding this position. The independent assessor recommended that this position should be reclassified as civilian, while the interview-based assessment team concluded that a sworn member is required for this position. Based on observations of several police agencies in the United States and the United Kingdom that use civilians in this capacity, the Civilianization Study recommended that the potential to civilianize this position should be explored further.

Discussion

The VPD has previously recognized that certain positions and duties in the forensic services field do not require the skills, training, or experience of a police officer. Therefore, all duties pertaining to the photo lab, analysis of firearms and tool marks, identifying fingerprints via the Automated Fingerprint Identification System (AFIS), and the collection of fingerprints of persons accused of a crime as well as people that wish to obtain a record clearance, have been given to civilian staff. As a result, the VPD currently has more civilians than sworn members working in a forensic service capacity. The VPD is on the leading edge in Canada in terms of using civilians in the field of forensic services; this fact was well documented in Appendix I of the Civilianization Study.

Despite these facts, the Civilianization Study found that specially trained civilians could theoretically be used to process crime scenes, a duty that is currently performed by sworn officers in the VPD. As a result, this possibility was examined further. Currently, sworn officers that process crime scenes are trained and certified at the Canadian Police College (CPC) in Ottawa. The CPC is the only governing body in Canada that trains and certifies police staff in forensic identification techniques and methods. The CPC was contacted as part of the follow-up to the civilianization study. Staff at the CPC advised that their forensic courses are built on the training and experience that police officers possess. In addition, the CPC is aware of the use of civilians by police agencies in other countries. However, the CPC still stands by the current model of training police officers in this regard as a best practice in Canada.

Recommendation,

The courses offered by the CPC require the skills and experience of a trained police officer. As there is no proven method to train or certify civilians in this regard in Canada, the VPD should continue to adhere to the accepted best practice in Canadian policing. Thus, it is recommended that these positions remain classified as sworn.

Position: Sergeant, Labour Relations

Findings of the Civilianization Study

The Civilianization Study reached a consensus regarding this position as both the independent assessor and the interview-based assessment team recommended that labour relations should be classified as a sworn position.

Discussion

The activities of the labour relations position have not changed since the Civilianization Study was conducted in March of 2006. As a result, the primary duties associated with this position are the handling of all grievances, arbitrations, human rights complaints, collective bargaining issues, return to work initiatives, Workers' Compensation Board claims, accommodation or modification of members' duties, as well as personal and substance abuse issues that may require professional or medical intervention. In addition, this position is involved in ensuring that internal discipline activities are properly carried out; the results of these activities are then reported to the Office of the Police Complaint Commissioner. Fulfilling these duties requires an individual that has considerable experience with the policies and procedures of the VPD, the provisions of the Collective Agreement, and the application of the Police Act. Also, the investigation of workplace issues and the discipline activities that are required in this position do not permit the civilianization of this position.

It should be noted that the labour relations position and the attendance management position are both part of the Employee Relations Unit. This unit is managed by a civilian employee, Mr. Louis Odendaal, who is an experienced practitioner in the field of labour relations and labour law. As a result, the Sergeant in labour relations is overseen by a civilian that is capable of informing and advising the sworn member in areas that they may be less familiar with such as the requirements of legislation that governs labour practices, recent common law decisions in labour law, and industry trends in this field. Thus, the current structure of the Employee Relations Unit efficiently combines the core competencies and expertise of sworn and civilian staff.

Recommendation

As the duties and activities of this position have not changed since the civilianization study, there is no reason to believe that this position can now be filled by a civilian. Examination of the duties associated with this position confirms the findings of the independent assessor and the interview-based assessment team that labour relations should remain a sworn position.

Position: Sergeant, Attendance Management

Findings of the Civilianization Study

The Civilianization Study reached a consensus regarding this position as both the independent assessor and the interview-based assessment team recommended that attendance management should be classified as a sworn position.

Discussion

The activities of the attendance management position have not changed since the Civilianization Study was concluded in March of 2006. The primary duty of this position is to liaise and communicate with members, in order to balance the personal needs of the individual against the need of the organization to have productive and healthy employees. This position requires an individual that is credible at providing advice to members in the areas of stress management, disability or medical concerns, grief management, and problem work environments. Often at times, this position has to identify the underlying cause of problems that occur in the workplace. For example, a member may be absent for a significant period of time because of stress. The stress, however, is typically the symptom of an underlying issue, which may be related to the workplace or the individual's personal life. It is imperative that the labour relations position is staffed by an individual that sworn members will feel comfortable discussing these underlying problems with. Having such an individual in this role minimizes absenteeism rates and ensures that individuals who require professional and/or medical intervention receive access to such resources.

Recommendation

An examination of the roles and duties associated with this position indicate that a sworn member is preferable to a civilian as there is a greater likelihood that employees will discuss not only the identified problem, but also the underlying causes. This conclusion is supported by the fact that the VPD has achieved the lowest absenteeism rates of any department of the City of Vancouver when a sworn member has occupied this position. Having a sworn member in this position increases the VPD's ability to seek solutions that address the root causes of absenteeism. This promotes employees returning to work as soon as practical, reduces the probability of re-occurrence, and ensures that staff receive access to professional and/or medical services as needed. Therefore, this analysis confirms the result reached by both the independent assessor and the interview-based assessment team that the attendance management position should remain classified as sworn.

Position: Sergeant, Career Development Unit

Findings of the Civilianization Study

The Civilianization Study found that there was a discrepancy regarding this position. The independent assessor recommended that this position remain a sworn position, while the interview-based assessment team concluded that this position could be civilianized. As a result of this discrepancy, the Civilianization Study recommended that this position remain classified as sworn, until a Strategic Business Plan for this unit was created as part of the Organizational Review.

Discussion

The primary activities of this unit involve coordinating performance development activities, providing career planning advice for sworn officers and administering the Sergeant and Inspector selection processes.

As part of performance development, this unit is required to prepare and maintain job descriptions for each sworn position in the VPD. Also, the unit meets with members to help create and design plans that meet their career objectives, this includes promotional opportunities as well as lateral transfers. These activities require senior officers that have held a number of positions throughout the department, so that accurate guidance can be given in terms of what skills, abilities, and experience are required for various positions.

For the Sergeant Selection Process, the Career Development Unit coordinates the process including determining the eligibility of the candidates, administering the promotion exam, reviewing the resumes and performance appraisals of the candidates, and arranging the candidates interviews. Coordinating and administering the Sergeant Selection Process requires a sworn police officer, namely one that is already a Sergeant, to identify the skills and abilities that are required by a police supervisor.

Recommendation

An assessment of the duties associated with this position shows that the experience and knowledge of a police officer are required to determine the skills and abilities that are required for sworn positions in the organization, to provide accurate guidance to members on how they can best achieve their career goals, and to administer the Sergeant Selection Process. This conclusion is supported by Mike Zora, the City of Vancouver's General Manager of Human Resources, who stated "the Career Development Unit requires sworn members due to their skills, training, and experience." Based on these findings, it is recommended that this position remain classified as sworn.

Position: Inspector, Human Resources Section

Findings of the Civilianization Study

The Civilianization Study reached a consensus regarding this position as both the independent assessor and the interview-based assessment team recommended that this position should be classified as sworn.

Discussion

Since the civilianization study occurred in March 2006, the duties associated with this position have not changed. In examining other police departments across Canada it was determined that there is no clear consensus as to whether this position should be classified as sworn or civilian. Seven major Canadian police forces were selected as a study sample. It was determined that four departments have a sworn officer in this position (Calgary, Edmonton, Winnipeg, and Regina) while three departments have a civilian in this position (Ottawa, Toronto, and Peel Regional). It appears that all the departments have blended Human Resource Sections that make use of both sworn and civilian staff. In terms of departments that make use of a civilian manager in this position, the Toronto Police Service (TPS) is larger but somewhat comparable to the VPD. However, it should be noted that while the TPS has a civilian staff member as the head of their Human Resources Section, they still have sworn managers in this same section. As a result, using a TPS model of human resource management in the VPD would actually involve the addition of a civilian staff member, which would occupy a place in the organizational chart that is above the Inspector position. As such, this would be a resource addition, not a civilianization of this position.

While not formally asked in the three questions that comprise the civilianization grid, the decision as to whether a position could be civilianized should also consider leadership development benefits and cost implications. As noted in the civilianization study, arguably the most comprehensive and thorough civilianization study previously completed was done by the Dallas Police Department (DPD). This study by the DPD asked the same three primary questions that the VPD used in its civilianization grid. In addition to these three primary issues, this study also acknowledged that some positions are key areas where leadership development occurs. The position of Inspector of Human Resources in the VPD can be seen as promoting leadership development, which is supported by the fact that two of the four current Deputy Chief Constables in the VPD have previously held this position.

Another consideration that must be evaluated is the cost implication of civilianizing a given position. Both the VPD and DPD civilianization study agree that the primary driver for civilianization is the cost savings that can be achieved. Typically, civilianization of a position results in a net cost savings. As a result, cost implications are often not considered on a position-specific basis; instead, it is believed that if civilianization takes place a cost reduction will automatically occur as this is the typical result. However, it is doubtful that civilianizing this position would result in cost savings.

The 2005 Statement of Financial Information for the City of Vancouver indicates that both the General Manager of Human Resources and the Manager of Employee Relations and Advisory Services for the City of Vancouver receive superior compensation than a typical Inspector in the VPD. In addition to this information, an independent assessment of salary level that would be typical of such a position was obtained from a current human resources director of a large Canadian firm that has a regional branch in Vancouver. This advisor stated that based on this position's span of control, the number of persons reporting directly to this position, and the complex multi-union and legal environment of the VPD, a reasonable base salary for this position would be in the range of \$120,000 to \$140,000 per year. While not the focus of the Civilianization Study it is worth considering that civilianizing this position is unlikely to result in any cost savings.

Recommendation

Currently, there are six units under the command of this Inspector position. Of these six units, three are headed by civilian staff, including a civilian manager, while the other three are headed by sworn members. As such, the VPD is in line with other police departments across Canada in that it utilizes a significant blend of civilians and sworn staff in its Human Resources Section. Given the concerns that have been identified above, this analysis finds no reason to challenge the recommendation of the Civilianization Study that this position should remain classified as sworn.

Other Recommendations from Phase 1

The project team made 11 additional recommendations to the VPD upon completing Phase 1 of the Operational Review.

1. THAT, the VPD Human Resources Section create a system to ensure periodic, regular reviews of all position profiles to ensure they are current.

The position profiles for all sworn positions were reviewed during the Civilianization Study that was completed in March 2006. Several inaccuracies were identified at that time and rectified by one of the Sergeants in the Career Development Unit. The civilian profiles were all reviewed during 2006 in preparation for the fall launch of the civilian Performance Development Program. In addition, the Sergeants in the Career Development Unit are moving to a bi-annual review of position profiles as part of the Performance Development Program. The next review of position profiles will take place in 2008.

2. THAT, the VPD explores relocating the Crime Analysis Unit from the Patrol Support Section to the Planning and Research Section.

This is being reviewed as part of the mini-business plan process and will be completed during the spring of 2007. The mini-business plans and interviews with supervisory personnel have been completed and the analysis is still being conducted. An initial review of other police departments has shown that the following agencies integrate their Crime Analysis Unit with their Planning and Research Section:

- Calgary Police Service
- Winnipeg Police Service
- Toronto Police Service
- Ottawa Police Service
- Scottsdale Police Department

While other agencies do not integrate the two:

- Edmonton Police Service
- Regina Police Service
- Peel Regional Police Service
- Seattle Police Department

The final results will be reported back during the mini-business plan study.

3. THAT, the VPD relocates the Quality Assurance Section to the Planning and Research Section and that the Planning and Research Section be re-named the Planning, Research and Audit Section.

This is in progress and should be completed by February 2007. The new Audit Manager position was posted in December, 2006 and the interview process will take place in February. This newly civilianized position will report directly to the civilian Director in charge of the Planning and Research Section. The office space has already been identified and will be located on the same floor in close proximity to the Planning and Research Section at 2120 Cambie Street.

4. THAT, the VPD adopts the International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) Model Policy on Civilianization.

The IACP Model Policy on Civilianization is a general guideline for agencies to manage civilian staff. It identifies a number of areas relating to:

- Maintaining civilian job descriptions
- Civilians are not allowed to enforce the law
- Procedures for screening civilian applicants including a criminal records check

- Civilians will be issued identification cards containing up to date photographs and shall wear them at all times while at work
- Civilians will be provided pre-service training, in-service training and receive an orientation program introducing them to the agency
- Civilians will be subject to periodic performance appraisals

All of these items are already in place at the VPD and nothing has to be added. The areas covered by the IACP guidelines include:

- *Duties and responsibilities of civilian employees shall be defined in job descriptions maintained in this agency's personnel office. In addition the following shall be observed with respect to civilian employees:*
- *Civilian employees shall not be requested to perform duties and responsibilities for which a commission as a sworn law enforcement officer is required. Civilian personnel shall not use their employment status with this law enforcement agency as authority for or responsibility to enforce the law. Civilian employees have no authority to take enforcement actions beyond those authorized for any citizen under the laws of this state.*
- *When on light-duty status, sworn personnel may be assigned temporarily to designated civilian positions only if a. additional qualified personnel are needed to assist in the job assignment, and b. the officer has or can be readily provided with the requisite knowledge and skills to adequately perform duties of the position.*
- *Procedures for screening applicants for civilian positions shall conform to agency policy for sworn officers unless otherwise specified by the personnel job description. All civilian employees assigned or having access to criminal history records, fingerprint files, investigative records, tactical information, emergency communications or other assignments or materials of a sensitive nature shall undergo a background investigation to include a criminal history check prior to employment.*
- *All civilian employees shall be issued an agency identification card containing an up-to date photograph. Photographic identification cards shall be color-coded to reflect the employee's security clearance as specified by the personnel office. Civilian employees shall wear their personal identification card at all times while in the law enforcement agency and/or when dealing with the public as a police employee.*
- *Civilian personnel of this agency shall be provided with the following: pre-service training, as required, that will prepare them for their job assignments and integrate them as productive members of this agency; and in-service training that will maintain basic skills and develop new knowledge, skills and abilities for career development.*
- *All newly appointed civilian personnel will receive an orientation program introducing them to this agency, to include the following: agency role, purpose, goals, policies*

and procedures, working conditions, rules and regulations, and rights and responsibilities of employees

- *Certain civilian positions within this agency require training on specific job responsibilities prior to assuming the position. Field training and formalized classroom instruction in these areas shall be successfully completed before duties are assumed.*
- *Courses designed specifically for civilian employees will be provided on a periodic basis by and through the training authority of this agency. Announcements of course availabilities shall be provided to all affected employees in a timely manner. Participation depends upon supervisory approval.*
- *Civilian employees are subject to periodic performance appraisal in conformance with schedules and procedures established by this agency's personnel authority.*
- *Civilian volunteers serving without pay are a valuable asset to this law enforcement agency and may be used in a variety of functions that will promote the agency's efficiency, effectiveness, mission and goals. Civilian volunteers are subject to the same provisions and restrictions governing other civilian employees as defined in this policy.*

5. THAT, the VPD creates a written policy on civilianization that includes the three questions comprising the decision making tree in the Civilianization Study.

The VPD Human Resources Section is currently drafting a comprehensive policy manual. A written policy on civilianization has been included in this manual and it will be linked through the VPD Regulations and Procedures Manual - Section 51.01 - *Procedure for Change in Authorized Strength, Organizational Structure, or Resource Re-Allocation*. The draft policy from the Human Resources policy manual is noted below:

CREATION OF POSITIONS WITHIN THE DEPARTMENT

Policy

It is the policy of the Department to use the following decision making tree to guide the assessment of future positions that may be developed within the VPD. That assessment will determine whether the position should be a sworn position or a civilian position.

Purpose

In order to determine whether a newly proposed position should be classified as sworn or civilian, the Human Resources Section Manager shall ask the following questions:

1. Does the position require law enforcement powers? (i.e. powers of arrest, use of force, statutory requirement, carrying a firearm)
2. Are the skills, training, experience, or credibility of a sworn police officer required to fulfill the duties of the position?
3. Can the requirements of the position be fulfilled by a specially-trained civilian?

These questions are sequential and the response to the first question determines whether the second question is asked, and then, the response to the second question determines whether the third and final question will be asked. The above questions will guide the assessment of future positions that may be developed within the Vancouver Police Department.

6. THAT, the VPD develop a tenure policy for secondments. It should be noted that the Human Resources Section of the VPD was developing a tenure policy for secondments while the Civilianization Study was in progress.

The four year tenure rule for secondments was being developed during the time of the Civilianization Study and was implemented in March 2006. Any new MOU terms for secondments shall include participation in the VPD Performance Development Program and limit secondment tenure to three years plus a potential additional year (which is mutually agreed to by both organizations).

7. THAT, the VPD consolidate all of its current policies on accommodation into one formal policy, such policy to be guided by best practices in other police departments and municipalities.

The VPD Human Resources Section has established protocols in place to deal with accommodated employees:

- Disability/Absenteeism Management Program
- *2003-2006 Collective Agreement between the Vancouver Police Board Section and the Vancouver Police Union – Schedule C (e) Members with Limited Ability*
- Established labour law covering the employer's "duty to accommodate"

8. THAT, the VPD develop a written policy on developmental positions which includes the objectives of developmental positions and potential areas of placement throughout the Department.

The Career Development Unit in the Human Resources Section, will be including a policy on developmental positions as part of the Performance Development Program.

This is an evolving program that began with sworn officers and was expanded to include civilian staff in 2006.

9. THAT, the VPD transfer the positions of False Alarm Reduction Coordinator and the four clerk typists to the City of Vancouver and a transition plan be prepared to effect this change by the end of 2006.

The Steering Committee recommended that the False Alarm Reduction Program (FARP) be transferred from the VPD to the City of Vancouver. This would have included the civilian positions of the False Alarm Reduction Coordinator and the four clerk typists.

The VPD District 4 Inspector and the Co-Director of Licenses and Inspections were tasked with developing a transition plan to effect this change by the end of 2006.

Unanticipated issues arose which will not make this transition possible. Further research into this topic revealed that a change to the Vancouver Charter would be required. Section 279(B) of the Vancouver Charter, dealing with the "Regulation of Burglar Alarms," grants regulation authority for burglar alarms to the Vancouver Police Board.

10. THAT, the VPD and the City of Vancouver create a working group comprised of VPD and City of Vancouver Payroll professionals to explore implementing shared services in the area of Payroll.

The working group will:

- a. report to the Steering Committee;**
- b. be co-chaired by the VPD and City of Vancouver managers who are responsible for Payroll;**
- c. be established no later than April 30th, 2006;**
- d. conduct all analysis necessary, including costs and benefits, to determine if there is a reasonable business case for structuring COV/VPD Payroll as a shared service;**
- e. present any disagreements to the Steering Committee;**
- f. develop an implementation plan if the Steering Committee approves proceeding with Payroll as a shared service; and,**

g. report back the final results to the Steering Committee by September 30th, 2006.

A Payroll Working Group of eight people was established and is co-chaired by the VPD Inspector in charge of the Human Resources Section and the Acting Director of Financial Services for the City. The working group has been updating the Steering Committee on a regular basis and is still trying to resolve some outstanding issues.

The Vancouver Police Union has raised concerns over service delivery reduction and the resolution of collective agreement interpretation and pay disputes. Also, the Teamsters Union employees who currently work in Payroll have raised concerns over transferring to CUPE, which would be required for this to become a shared service. One of the main concerns for current staff is the potential loss of the compressed work week.

While these issues are not insurmountable, they will require more time to resolve. The Steering Committee has agreed to keep moving forward with this potential shared service to see if these obstacles can be overcome.

11. THAT, the VPD continue to support the 311 Call Centre initiative and the opportunity for shared services with the switchboard telephone operators.

The City is taking the lead on Vancouver's 311 Call Centre initiative. The system is designed to deal with non-emergency calls and to improve public access to all municipal service information. This follows similar systems that have been implemented in Calgary and Chicago.

The VPD continues to support this initiative and the Inspector in charge of the Communications Section has been involved in ongoing discussions between the City and E-Comm.