

These Minutes will be adopted at the Regular Council meeting on September 12, 2006.



CITY OF VANCOUVER
SPECIAL COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
JULY 6 AND 17, 2006

A Special Meeting of the Council of the City of Vancouver was held on Thursday, July 6, 2006, at 7:30 p.m., in the Council Chamber, Third Floor, City Hall, for the purpose of hearing from delegations on *The Implications of Repealing the Highway Oriented Retail (HOR) Policies and Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area*. The Special Meeting reconvened on Monday, July 17, 2006, at 7:30 p.m. to continue hearing speakers. The minutes are consolidated for ease of reference.

PRESENT:

- Mayor Sam Sullivan
- Councillor Suzanne Anton
- Councillor Elizabeth Ball
- Councillor David Cadman
- Councillor Kim Capri
- Councillor George Chow
- *Councillor Heather Deal
- Councillor Peter Ladner
- Councillor B.C. Lee
- *Councillor Raymond Louie
- *Councillor Tim Stevenson

ABSENT: Councillor Raymond Louie (July 6, 2006)

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Diane Clairmont, Meeting Coordinator

* Denotes absence for a portion of the meeting.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

MOVED by Councillor Anton
SECONDED by Councillor Chow

THAT this Council resolve itself into Committee of the Whole, Mayor Sullivan in the Chair.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Councillors Deal, Louie and Stevenson not present for the vote)

MOVED by Councillor Ball

THAT Council close the speaker's list for the Special Council meeting on *The Implications of Repealing the Highway Oriented Retail (HOR) Policies and Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area*.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(Councillors Deal and Stevenson not present for the vote)

1. The Implications of Repealing the Highway Oriented Retail (HOR) Policies and Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area (VanRIMS No.: 11-200-30)

At its meeting on May 16, 2006, Council received the Policy Report *Implications of Repealing the Highway Oriented Retail (HOR) Policies and Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area*, dated May 1, 2006, and referred it to a future meeting of Council to hear from the public and also directed staff to meet with residents, business and property owners in advance of that meeting to answer questions regarding the options included in the Policy Report.

Accordingly, Council had before it the above-named Policy Report, in which the Director of City Plans in consultation with the General Manager of Engineering Services discussed the implications of repealing the Highway Oriented Retail Policies and Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area and presented options for Council's consideration. Council also had before it a staff memo dated June 27, 2006 which provided a summary of Public Information Meetings on the subject. The General Manager of Community Services submitted B through F for consideration.

Lynda Challis, Senior Planner, City Plans, reviewed the report and along with Pat Wotherspoon, Assistant Director, City Plans; Heather Burpee, Planning Analyst; and Paul Pinsker, Engineer II, Parking and Transportation, responded to questions regarding:

- differences between Marine Drive and Grandview Highway policies;
- size of stores;
- rezoning guidelines and options to rezone with different uses/boundaries;
- impacts on public transit;
- use of terms "large format areas" versus "highway-oriented retail"; and
- definition of "general merchandise".

In response to Council's request for additional information at the July 6, 2006 meeting, the staff Memo dated July 14, 2006 was distributed to Council at the July 17, 2006 meeting.

The following spoke in favour of Consideration B (that large format retail uses along a portion of the Marine Drive frontage be repealed so that the area is retained for I-2 industrial use and large format retail uses can no longer be considered in this area):

David Chudnovsky, MLA, Vancouver Kensington
Tara Ivanochko, The Civic Society Development Project
Mark Engleden

Susan Faehndrich
Adrienne Montani
Katherine Ruffen
Stan Jang
Ian Marcuse
Louise Seto
Ildi Varga
Greg Booth
Sally Teich
Ned Jacobs
Bev Ballantyne
Veronica Ross
Anne Roberts
Ann Grant
Dan Rogers, Society Promoting Environmental Conservation
Peter Haskell, Unitarian Church
Isabel Minty
Catherine Douglas (brief/petition submitted - on file)
Gary Jarvis
Deming Smith, Better Environmentally Sound Transportation (B.E.S.T.)
Skye Richards

Speakers' comments included:

- Vancouver Kensington is diverse including residential neighbourhoods and small businesses which support each other and are concerned about balance, dynamics of the proposed changes - this partnership should not be undermined;
- there are four important business corridors in the Vancouver Kensington area;
- traffic and environment will be negatively impacted as Marine Drive is already congested; airport is planning dramatic future growth; population increase in other communities will feed onto bridges and arterials;
- traffic will skirt gridlock and impact bike routes;
- there is a need to know impact on traffic north of Marine Drive;
- land use and transportation are closely linked; need land use decision to be compatible with RAV station at Cambie and Marine Drive;
- City needs to look at challenges to environment with every decision;
- eco-density initiative good as it moves to development of a sustainable City;
- urban sprawl, including HOR, contributes to compromising environment;
- designation of HOR undermines City initiatives already approved, including visioning process and City Plan; Council should respect the process and its outcomes;
- the proposed changes focus on automobile useage and this is not good;
- keep industrial zoning, but develop overall plan to use entrance to Vancouver, including Marine Drive frontage, in interesting and creative ways; big box stores are not a welcoming sight;
- do not remove choice to walk to stores; Fraser Street shopping will be at risk;
- report is missing details on impact relating to children's heath issues;
- presence of big box stores reduces consumer choice as smaller options are driven out;

- preserve industrial area for better paying jobs which is consistent with City policies and wishes of citizens;
- adhere to known principles of sustainable development;
- return to I-2 industrial uses;
- there are numerous large format stores in City already; no need to take away valuable industrial land;
- more people walking in neighbourhoods increases feeling of safety, reduces policing costs as crime is reduced;
- while there may be minimal impact on existing businesses, large format stores with general merchandise will hurt future growth of retail in the area;
- energy prices will increase in future which will increase prices at big box stores;
- to avoid impact on local economy, Vancouver must become less auto-oriented;
- HOR is a global issue as it supports continued consumption; must reduce consumption to reduce environmental impact and have the world fairly share finite resources;
- statistics presented in support of HOR are a small sampling and not definitive;
- this area presents an opportunity for a densification plan with a green footprint incorporating transit, buses, bikeways;
- community visioning did not support big box stores;
- uses for this area could incorporate churches, private recreation;
- alarming that Council may support private interests that are intrinsically unsustainable and subverting sound practices;
- big box stores buy industrial land at firesale prices and impose huge ecological cost;
- do not build additional road space for one-owner businesses;
- moratorium recommended until an independent study done;
- limit size of big box stores anywhere in Vancouver;
- HOR will negatively impact sustainable living; smaller stores will be unable to compete and will close; amenities will be lost, lifestyles changed forever;
- HOR forces people into cars increasing pollution/mental stress and health care costs;
- being opposed to HOR is not nimbysm; citizens are not telling people where to shop, they are trying to build a livable community and good faith is on the line;
- the City's study is more viable than retailer's survey; survey wording can be problematic;
- automotive oriented development is a dinosaur based on current world situation regarding climate change, impact on resources, and health risks;
- a progressive homeless shelter would be better use of land on Marine Drive;
- personal survey of business owners in the area indicated HOR not wanted;
- big box stores locate in areas where there tends to be rapid growth; they cause retail layoffs and lower earnings and some engage in negative employee practices;
- increased traffic will impact negatively on bikeways in the area;
- repealing HOR will be consistent with various City plans already in place; and
- big box stores encourage credit card debt which has a negative impact on society.

The following spoke in favour of Consideration D (that HOR Policies and Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area be retained so that rezoning applications for all large format retail uses, except food sales, can be considered in this area), with some speakers requesting food sales should be included:

Paul Tubbe, Chair, Advisory Committee on Diversity Issues
Myrtle Knull
Preet Dhillon
Kulwinder Shahi
Barb Justason and Kevin Groh, Justason Market Intelligence and WalMart
Ziv Kawarsky
Trent Holfeld, Canadian Tire Real Estate Limited
Michael McDonald, Kasian Architecture Interior Design & Planning
Caroline Casselman, Director, Community & Public Affairs, Canadian Tire Corporation
(petition submitted - on file)
Ram Narain
Stephen Knight, Sitings Realty Limited
Gordon Harris
Jay Byfield, South Vancouver Mini-Public Storage
Peter Jackman, Director, Membership Marketing, The Vancouver Board of Trade (brief
submitted - on file)
Chris Wood
Jamie Koehl, Canadian Tire
Glenn Nicholson
Tiffany Duzita, Smart Centres
Mike Fong, Overwaitea Foods
Geoff Stollery, Best Buy Canada

Speakers' comments included;

- allowing highway-oriented retail in the area matches needs of people including families, significant aging population, persons with all abilities, and those looking for good value;
- larger stores bring economies of scale;
- some people need to use cars; and/or have shopping available close to transit centres;
- middle class has less disposable income and need good choices;
- specialty shops will still be available;
- larger stores will not significantly impact small owners negatively;
- South Vancouver is historically important;
- South Vancouver residents support HOR;
- HOR will provide part-time jobs for youth without having to go outside community; will assist with tuition fees;
- HOR would be appropriate use of existing land which has been vacant for several years and is unsightly;
- residents, including elderly, can walk to large format stores as easily as other stores and will not have to rely on family members to take them shopping;
- Wal-Mart representatives made the following comments:
 - purchased land a year after HOR established, with City endorsement and with the understanding that Marine Drive is an ideal location for HOR;
 - they are committed to developing land and will uphold previous promises;
 - their previous application was unique and acknowledged many concerns - will continue to address concerns with input from staff and community;
 - reviewed statistics from survey *Local Area Attitudes Toward Highway Oriented Retail* June 2006, (brief submitted - on file);

- big box stores do not provide the same products as many specialty, smaller stores and would not impact their sales;
- eliminating HOR will be a disservice by making residents leave Vancouver to shop;
- Canadian Tire Real Estate Limited representatives/supporters made the following comments:
 - purchased property in 2004, well after HOR policy established;
 - made revisions to proposals based on extensive consultation with City at considerable cost;
 - if HOR approved, will build LEED standard store which will bolster existing industrial area by providing 350 jobs;
 - will support local business and residents in area;
 - if repeal approved, sites of previous applicants, who purchased lands under previous HOR guidelines, should be excluded;
 - if Consideration C approved, Canadian Tire store should be allowed as it meets criteria of general merchandise;
 - Canadian Tire Cambie Street store is good densification /large format store model;
 - many residents/businesses support HOR, but cannot attend Council meeting because they are running their businesses;
- inclusion of highway-oriented retail indicates Council understands how people live/work and creates places for them; HOR guidelines were part of this process;
- HOR guidelines provide clear direction and can provide tangible public benefits;
- sustainable design has been consistent in applications put forth under HOR guidelines;
- there should be proportionate number of big box stores in Vancouver;
- statistics provided relating to rents, populations, retail inventory;
- retailers cannot find sites and are being forced to pay higher rents - not enough retail space to keep market stable;
- traffic flow based on flow from bridges going to other areas, not just Marine Drive;
- Vancouver contributing to regional traffic congestion due to consumers going to other municipalities;
- impact of big box stores would be felt by larger department stores in Vancouver and not smaller retailers;
- encouraged Council to support sustainable development in conjunction with smart growth principles - be first to have large format retailers focus on sustainability;
- there is enough tax base to provide residents with all necessary amenities/services;
- HOR may or may not impact negatively in certain aspects, but will definitely impact positively economically;
- it is not Council's obligation to protect small businesses;
- traffic flow will increase business for small retailers;
- preserving industrial land will have a negative impact on this area - all US cities that failed to rezone are now run-down, both physically and economically;
- if HOR approved, mitigation measures would minimize negative effect on neighbourhood shopping areas and development would be to enhanced environmental standards and a heritage building and large open space would be retained;
- transit is used for Metrotown despite lots of parking; this will also happen on Marine Drive;
- City Plan has directives recognizing need to preserve industrial lands; thus, Marine Drive is designated as industrial;
- Sunset Visioning acknowledges need for big box stores;

- economic stability comes from adhering to policy;
- vocal minority should not outweigh statistics; and
- food stores should not be restricted from Marine Drive HOR as grocery store items are sold by various retailers, therefore, it would not be equitable to preclude food stores.

Donald Berg provided comments on industrial lands in general, but not pertaining to the HOR issue on Marine Drive.

In response to Council questions, Staff responded regarding the following:

- land use and types of industry; existing zoning and viable options, including future industrial use, and definition of highly generative types of businesses;
- information gathered through retail impact studies;
- traffic patterns/statistics, including traffic trips to big box stores and road capacity;
- impact of traffic using large format retail sites on environment and air quality;
- retail survey process and data developed;
- Council decision-making process regarding future applications;
- impact of public transit in the area (e.g. Canada Line);
- neighbourhood density around the proposed sites;
- communication regarding community public meetings, mailings, contact with BIA;
- parking stall standards;
- patterns relating to bulk purchasing and use of transit/bicycles;

MOVED by Councillor Ladner

- A. THAT Main Street to Yukon Street be retained for large format uses in accordance with the 'Highway-Oriented Retail Policies And Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area', but that large format retail uses be limited to Marine Drive frontage between Manitoba and Main Streets; and

FURTHER THAT in keeping with Council's recent decision to remove non-industrial conditional uses and provide greater land use flexibility in the I-2 and M-2 zones, Council will allow rezoning consideration of large format institutional, cultural and recreational uses throughout the area, especially those well-served by transit; and

FURTHER THAT Council instruct staff to include the area west of Manitoba in the Marine Drive Station Area Planning program for consideration for more transit-supportive and employment intensive development.

- B. THAT the Highway Oriented Retail (HOR) Policies and Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area be amended as set out in Appendix A of Policy Report *The Implications of Repealing the Highway Oriented Retail (HOR) Policies and Guidelines: Marine Drive Industrial Area*, dated May 1, 2006, to take into account proximity to the Canada Line station and to reinforce policies that protect the Ontario Street Bikeway, encourage sustainable features and heritage retention, and seek traffic mitigation.

carried

AMENDMENT MOVED by Councillor Deal

THAT the words "excluding clothing" be inserted in Clause A of the motion following the words "large format uses".

LOST

(Councillors Anton, Ball, Capri, Ladner, Lee and Mayor Sullivan opposed)

The amendment having lost, the motion was put and CARRIED with Councillors Cadman, Chow, Deal, Louie and Stevenson opposed.

RISE FROM COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

MOVED by Councillor Ladner

THAT the Committee of the Whole rise and report.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

ADOPT REPORT OF COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

MOVED by Councillor Ladner

SECONDED by Councillor Anton

THAT the report of the Committee of the Whole be adopted.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

The Special Council recessed at 10:35 p.m. on July 6, 2006
and adjourned at 10:45 p.m. on July 17, 2006.

* * * * *