



**POLICY REPORT
DEVELOPMENT AND BUILDING**

Report Date: April 25, 2016
Contact: Anita Molaro
Contact No.: 604.871.6479
RTS No.: 11426
VanRIMS No.: 08-2000-20
Meeting Date: May 17, 2016

TO: Vancouver City Council

FROM: Acting General Manager of Planning and Development Services

SUBJECT: 3738 Cypress Street - Application for removal from First Shaughnessy Protected Heritage Property List

RECOMMENDATION

THAT the application to amend the Heritage Conservation Area Official Development Plan (the "HCA ODP") to remove the building existing prior to January 1, 1940 on lands having a civic address of 3738 Cypress Street [PID: 008-914-958; Lot 1A, Block 42, District Lot 526, Plan 4502] (the "Subject Property") from the list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties, which is at Appendix A4 of Schedule A of the HCA ODP, be referred to a public hearing together with the recommendation from the Acting General Manager of Planning and Development Services to approve the application;

FURTHER THAT the Director of Legal Services be instructed to prepare the necessary by-law amendment for consideration at public hearing.

REPORT SUMMARY

This report recommends that Council refer the application to remove the Subject Property at 3738 Cypress Street from the list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties to public hearing and that the application be approved.

COUNCIL AUTHORITY/PREVIOUS DECISIONS

On September 29, 2015, Council enacted the HCA ODP, which designated First Shaughnessy as a heritage conservation area and includes, as Appendix A4 of Schedule A of the HCA ODP, a list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties. The HCA ODP, including the list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties, was amended on March 8, 2016.

CITY MANAGER'S/GENERAL MANAGER'S COMMENTS

The Acting General Manager of Planning and Development Services recommends approval of the foregoing.

REPORT

Background/Context

In September 2015, Council adopted the HCA ODP which designated the First Shaughnessy Heritage Conservation Area (FSHCA) as the first heritage conservation area in Vancouver. The FSHCA includes General Guidelines, a Statement of Significance, Design Guidelines, and Appendix A4 of the FSHCA includes a list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties, including the Subject Property located at 3738 Cypress Street. Council also approved a series of other by-laws intended to work together with the HCA ODP to support the preservation and protection of the unique character of the FSHCA, including the Heritage Procedure By-law and the Heritage Property Standards of Maintenance By-law.

Strategic Analysis

On March 15, 2016, Measured Architecture and Paul Sangha Landscape Architecture submitted a heritage character and heritage value assessment for the Subject Property, on behalf of the property owner. The material included photo documentation of the existing house, archival research, and architectural drawings illustrating previous alterations and modifications to the house (1970 and 1982). See appendix A for photos.

Based on the submitted materials, staff completed an assessment of the heritage character and heritage value of the Subject Property based on the Heritage Procedure By-law and the Design Guidelines that apply. Part 3 of the Heritage Procedure By-law specifies the factors to be considered in determining the heritage character or heritage value of a property which include:

- a) the aesthetic, historic, scientific, cultural, social or spiritual importance or significance of the building, feature, property, site or area;
- b) the age of a building;
- c) the builder or architect;
- d) the architectural composition of a building;
- e) the definitions and application of "heritage value" and "character-defining elements" in the Parks Canada "Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada" © Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada, 2003, as amended and updated in 2010; and
- f) all applicable Council policies and guidelines.

The original house built on the property was completed in 1911 for Henry and Anna Alexander. Harry was the son of Vancouver pioneer Richard Alexander whose house was located on the adjacent property. Henry Alexander was born in 1873 and was the first white male born on Burrard Inlet. He was a lawyer and a judge and active member of the Royal Yacht Club. The original architect/builder of the house is not known. There are no photos or plans of the original building.

The design and composition of the Subject Property have been assessed based on the Heritage Character Defining Elements (sec 3.4.5) in the First Shaughnessy Heritage Conservation Area Design Guidelines. The specific character defining elements, including detailed description from the guidelines are listed below in italics, and the assessment of each element for 3738 Cypress Street follows in bullet form.

(a) Exterior Form:

The basic exterior form includes the orientation, scale, massing, composition and roof shape of the building. The exterior building form also contributes to the neighbourhood context which includes its spatial relationship with neighbouring buildings and the streetscape. All these attributes of exterior form enhance heritage character and heritage value.

- Basic exterior form that existed prior to alterations is still discernable against historical documentation (i.e. Fire Insurance Map): square footprint, 2½ storey gabled roof form.
- Orientation is intact, but overall scale, massing, composition and much of the roof shape has been changed through multiple additions to all sides.
- Spatial relationship with neighbouring buildings and streetscape is neutral.

(b) Roof:

Most early architecture in First Shaughnessy display prominent roof forms. Roof design includes elements such as cupolas, turrets, chimneys, gutters, weathervanes, gables, eaves, parapets, dormers, soffits, and fascias. Roof designs are integral to heritage character and heritage value.

- Original gabled roof with a modest south-side gable dormer in attic has been altered with chamfered gables and additions to the north side, rear and south side, enlargement of the original gabled attic dormer, and addition of the porte cochere.

(c) Exterior Walls:

Exterior walls include foundation walls, structural masonry including stone walls, wood or steel framing, and an exterior cladding system such as stucco, wood siding or shingles. Exterior walls provide the weatherproofing, structure, insulation and control of daylight. The type and quality of materials used for cladding of exterior walls also contributes to heritage character and heritage value.

- While much of the original framing is likely intact, substantial changes to exterior walls have occurred as a result of multiple additions and subsequent alterations.

- Original wood cladding may exist under new brick, stucco and board cladding, but given the degree of alteration it is also as likely that the cladding was removed upon the application of new materials in 1970.
- Some limited evidence of the original concrete foundation is present.
- The 1970 and 1982 alterations present the house as a poor example of a mock-Tudor style house, when it was most likely designed as a Craftsman house.

(d) Windows and Doors:

Exterior windows and doors include components such as frames, trims, mouldings, sashes, muntins and leaded glass. The hardware on windows and doors adds further detail and interest. The location and design of windows and doors give the building a sense of scale, rhythm, proportion and depth.

- No original doors, windows or hardware appear to exist.
- Even the mock-Tudor replacement windows shown in the 1982 drawings appear to have been later replaced.
- Appears that all window openings are not in the same place as the original house with the exception of the centrally-set attic windows in the front gable and one window at the rear (second floor).

(e) Entries and Porches:

The location and design of the entry and porch of a building contribute to the heritage character and heritage value of the building.

- The main entry appears to be in its original location based on the assumption that the front of the house was symmetrical - a centrally set entry with balanced windows on either side.
- The porch that ran the length of the south side of the house (shown on Fire Insurance Map) no longer exists. Although the existing verandah along that same side facing the pool speaks to that earlier porch, there are no elements left of the original porch.
- Porte cochere, entry stairs and other additions have entirely changed the way in which the house presents itself, and even the verandah on the north side and the open porch on the south side (second floor) as shown on the 1982 drawings have since been enclosed.

(f) Interior Architectural Features:

Interior architectural features include walls, ceiling, stairs, or other unique decorative features, such as columns, pilasters, windows, doors, window and door surrounds or architraves, projections, cornices, pediments and balustrades and their paints, finishes and colours, architectural hardware and all other similar interior features with heritage character or heritage value.

- No interior architectural features - walls, ceilings, stairs, or other unique decorative features such as columns, pilasters, windows, doors, window and door surrounds or architraves, projections, cornices, pediments and balustrades and their paints, finishes and colours, architectural hardware - are known to exist.

- Interior appears to have been completely altered, with the exception of the stairs leading from the second floor to the attic and the stairs at the north-east corner (likely servant's stairs).

(g) Landscape Features:

Include any fence, retaining wall, fountain, patio, terrace, statuary or similar feature or garden of significance that is located on a site and outside the exterior walls of a building.

- An early or original stone wall runs along the front of the site, with the original driveway entry on the south edge of the property with pillars framing the entry and a pedestrian gate set at the north end.
- The driveway would have run straight back to the garage at the south-east corner.
- The garage no longer exists - the pool is there now - and instead, an awkward circulation was added with the porte cochere and driveway wrapping around the north side of the house to connect to a new garage at the rear.

Summary of Heritage Character and Heritage Value Assessment

Based on the above assessment of the heritage character and heritage value of the Subject Property at 3738 Cypress Street staff determined that while the house has some historic merit and retains some of its original form it is compromised to a large degree by a series of more modern additions and alterations. Its integrity is further affected by removal of nearly all the elements that would contribute to its character such as the exterior materials including cladding, windows, doors and porches, and replacement materials that are not in keeping with the original character and style of the house. Staff concluded the Subject Property has been altered to the point of no longer having sufficient heritage character or heritage value to justify its conservation and therefore it should be removed from the list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties at Appendix A4 of Schedule A of the HCA ODP.

Comments of the Vancouver Heritage Commission

On April 11, 2016 the Statement of Significance (SoS) and Heritage Register Subcommittee of the Vancouver Heritage Commission reviewed the materials submitted by the owner's consultant and the staff assessment. The Subcommittee agreed with the conclusion that the Subject Property should be removed from the list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties. On April 25, 2016 the Heritage Commission approved the report and motion from the Subcommittee.

Financial Implications

There are no financial implications related to the recommendations in this report.

Removal Procedure

The list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties is part of the HCA ODP and amendments to an Official Development Plan must be approved by Council at public hearing. Approval of the recommendation in this report will refer the item to a public hearing at which time Council will make a decision with respect to the recommendation to remove the Subject Property from the list.

CONCLUSION

The owner of 3738 Cypress Street has applied to amend the HCA ODP to have the Subject Property removed from the list of First Shaughnessy protected heritage properties. The material has been assessed and reviewed by staff and the Vancouver Heritage Commission and determined that building has been significantly altered and no longer has heritage character or heritage value. The Acting General Manager of Planning and Development Services recommends that the application be referred to public hearing and that it be approved.

* * * * *

3738 Cypress Street - Photos



Photo 1. Front Elevation (facing West)



Photo 2. Front Elevation



Photo 3. Partial South Elevation